SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS REPORT ON PROSTITUTION OF BOYS IN PAKISTAN (LAHORE & PESHAWAR)

June 2006

ECPAT International

in collaboration with

Pakistan Pediatrics Association

Researchers

Dr. Tufail Muhammad Dr. Naeem Zafar

Research Advisor

Anil Raghuvanshi





© 2006 ECPAT International

ECPAT is a network of organisations and individuals working together to eliminate the commercial sexual exploitation of children. It seeks to encourage the world community to ensure that children everywhere enjoy their fundamental rights free from all forms of commercial sexual exploitation.

The ECPAT acronym stands for 'End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes'.

ECPAT International 328 Phayathai Road Ratchathewi, Bangkok 10400 THAILAND

Tel: (66 2) 215-3388 Fax: (66 2) 215-8272 Email: <u>info@ecpat.net</u> <u>media@ecpat.net</u> Web site: <u>www.ecpat.net</u>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword

Acknowledgments	
Research Team	
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	
Glossary of Local Terms	
Executive Summary	
1. INTRODUCTION	
1.1 PAKISTAN – COUNTRY PROFILE	
 1.2 INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL POLICIES AND LEGAL INSTRUMENTS 1.3 STRUCTURE OF THE NATIONAL PLAN OF ACTION	
1.5 STRUCTURE OF THE NATIONAL PLAN OF ACTION	
1.5 REVISION OF THE NATIONAL FLAN OF ACTION	
2. BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY	
2.1 Background	
2.1 BACKGROUND	
2.3 METHODOLOGY	
2.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	
2.5 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	
3. SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT	
3.1 Research Locations	
3.2 Gender Dynamics	
3.3 CLASS AND ETHNIC DYNAMICS	
3.4 SOCIETAL ATTITUDES TOWARDS THE PROSTITUTION OF BOYS	
4. LEGAL PROTECTION	
4.1 CHILD PROSTITUTION	
4.2 Child Pornography	
 4.3 CHILD MARRIAGE AND BIRTH REGISTRATION 4.4 CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE	
4.4 CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE 4.5 TRAFFICKING OF CHILDREN	
4.6 JUVENILE JUSTICE	
5. CHILD PROTECTION AND PREVENTION INITIATIVES IN PAKISTAN	
5.1 Child Protection Units	31
5.2 TRAINING OF LAW ENFORCEMENT PERSONNEL	
5.3 COORDINATION AND COOPERATION	
5.4 Prevention	
6. FORMS OF PROSTITUTION OF BOYS	
6.1 SEXUAL EXPLOITATION AND ABUSE OF CHILDREN IN AND AROUND BUS TERMINALS	
6.2 'FREE FLOATING' BOYS IN PROSTITUTION – HIJRAS, ZENANAS, CHAWAS AND MALISHIAS	
6.3 BACHABAZI	
6.4 CHILD PROSTITUTION IN SCHOOLS6.5 EXPOSURE OF CHILDREN TO PORNOGRAPHY AT INTERNET CAFÉS	
7. PROFILES OF BOY VICTIMS OF SEXUAL EXPLOITATION	

7.1 BOY VICTIMS OF COMMERCIAL SEXUAL EXPLOITATION 7.2 Sex Exploiters of Boys	39 41
8. INTERVIEW FINDINGS	
 8.1 BOYS AT RISK OF COMMERCIAL SEXUAL EXPLOITATION	49 50
9. RECOMMENDATIONS	52
9.1 IMMEDIATE ACTION 9.2 LONG TERM ACTIONS	52 53
10. APPENDICES	56
10.1 NGOS WORKING TO PROTECT CHILDREN FROM SEXUAL ABUSE AND EXPLOITATION 10.2 BIBLIOGRAPHY	

Foreword

Early research on child sex tourism highlighted the vulnerability of boys to sexual exploitation as has work related to the rights and protection of street children. Nevertheless, focused attention and action to address the commercial sexual exploitation of boys is still lacking even as many CSEC studies, undertaken worldwide, make reference to the exploitation of boys. Concerned that little progress is being made to promote and uphold the right of boys to protection from sexual exploitation, ECPAT International, partner organizations and social researchers in Bangladesh, India (Mumbai and Hyderabad) and Pakistan agreed to conduct situational analysis studies to assess the extent and nature of sexual exploitation of boy children in these countries and plan more targeted action.

As these studies demonstrate, prostitution of boys in general is not a new phenomenon. It has existed and been manifested in different ways for a long time. In fact, the sexual exploitation of boys thrives in many countries, taking place in locales such as streets, markets, bus terminals, hotels, restaurants, religious places, etc. Thus these studies in essence demonstrate and confirm that a large number of boys living and or working on the street are victims of sexual exploitation and they indicate that this phenomenon remains largely unreported, under-reported or misreported.

The findings also show that many misconceptions about the prostitution of boys remain and are firmly rooted in the continuing view that it is an issue related solely to homosexuality and child sex tourism. On the other hand they also underscore the overall vulnerability of all children, boys and girls, to be targeted by adults who seek to exploit them as sexual objects and demonstrate that those committing such crimes are largely individuals from the local heterosexual population and not solely homosexual men or tourists. While it is difficult to quantify the magnitude of the problem due to the lack of reporting or misreporting of cases, the studies nevertheless suggest that it is much bigger problem than previously recognized and that exploiters are local men and in some cases local women.

The research undertaken in the three countries provides a window for understanding the stereotyped gender constructions which underpin concepts of child protection, as related to boy children. That is, they show that our understanding about male roles and the myths that surround them – i.e. that boys must be tough and defend themselves being careful not to show any sign of weakness– have created barriers and led to inadequate protection of boy children including a social blindness in relation to their experiences of sexual exploitation and sexual violence. In this regard the findings clearly demonstrate that the unequal power relations which create vulnerability of children to sexual exploitation by exploitative adults can and do affect boys and girls in all environments.

The analysis of specific exploitative practices, which was been undertaken by these studies also highlight the different conditions under which such violations take place and show how sexual exploitation of boys can be manifested differently in different social and cultural contexts. For example, a practice called *bachabazi*, whereby boys are kept for sexual gratification of older

men, exists in the North-Western Pakistan, whereas in Mumbai, sexual exploitation of boys in transgender communities is a practice that has received little attention. It is also worth noting that the studies also show that gender segregation can be a significant factor affecting the protection of children, as closed societies can restrict adult male-female interaction creating less overall public scrutiny and accountability for social practices within those spaces. This factor can increase risks for boys and girls unless particular attention is given to their protection within those closed social spaces. Children in these situations appear to become more vulnerable as they can be easily accessed and targeted by the exploiters, while the exploitation may remain invisible.

Lastly, the physical, psychological and social harm documented in these reports dispels any notion that the sexual exploitation of boys is non-existent or occurs only in relation to tourism. We hope that it will result in immediate action by all agencies concerned with and responsible for the protection of children's rights.

Carmen Madriñan

Executive Director ECPAT International

Acknowledgments

The Child Rights and Abuse Committee of Pakistan Pediatric Association acknowledges the guidance and support of several individuals who helped in the design, sample selection, field work, data editing and processing of this study. We gratefully acknowledge the support of Ms. Amalee McCoy, Mr. Anil Raghuvanshi and Ms. Carmen Madriñan of ECPAT International in Bangkok. We are particularly grateful to members of the Working Group against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation for all their help and support at the time of report writing.

We are particularly thankful to the team of field interviewers who undertook the difficult task of field visiting, conducting focus group discussions and interviewing during the harsh summer months. Their dedicated services are gratefully acknowledged.

We are especially grateful many children and adults, who participated in this study. Several more individuals including community leaders and key informants participated in Focus Group Discussions and provided valuable information. A big "**Thank You**" to all of them.

Dr. Tufail Muhammad Khan Chairman CRAC-PPA

RESEARCH TEAM

Dr. Tufail Muhammad (Team Leader)

Pakistan Paediatric Association House 16, Street 13 K-3 Phase 3 Hayatabad, Peshawar, Pakistan Tel: + 92919217105, +923049001069 Fax: + 92919217094 E-mail: <u>tufailm@brain.net.pk</u>

Peshawar NWFP:

1-Mr.Munawar Hussain Nayab2-Mr.Muhammad Haroon3-Mr.Shah Fahad4-Ms. Saba Gul

Lahore:

Dr. Naeem Zafar (Local Team Leader) Dr. Muhammad Moaz Ms. Sarah Asad Ullah Mrs. Riffat Naeem Mr. Rana Imran Yousaf Ms. Mona Kausar

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
CEDAW	Convention to Eliminate all Forms of Discrimination against Women
CRAC-PPA	Child Rights and Abuse Committee of the Pakistan Pediatric Association
CRC	UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
CSA	Child Sexual Abuse
CSE	Child Sexual Exploitation
CSEC	Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children
ECPAT	End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking for Sexual
	Purpose
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
HIV	Human Immune Virus
IEC	Information, Education, Communication
ILO	International Labor Organization
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organization
LHRLA	Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid
MSM	Men who have sex with men
NCCR	NGOs Coalition on Child Rights
NCCWD	National Commission for Child Welfare and Development
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
NPA	National Plan of Action
NWFP	North West Frontier Province
PPA	Pakistan Pediatric Association
SAARC	South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
SACH	Struggle for Change
STI	Sexually Transmitted Infection
UN	United Nations
UNESCAP	United Nations Economic and Social Commission of Asia Pacific
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

GLOSSARY OF LOCAL TERMS

Bachabaz: Men who keep boys for long-term sexual gratification.

Bachabazi: Keeping of young boys for sexual gratification, usually by rich and influential adults in Pakistan.

Chakla: Brothel

Chawas: Usually young men who look and behave like ordinary males, and who indulge in sex with other men. They will penetrate and be penetrated, orally and anally.

Chowk: Cross-road or a square

Hijras: Also known as the third sex, *hijras* are biological males but are usually castrated. They consider themselves neither male or female, but commonly have feminine names, dress as women, wear jewellery and cosmetics, grow their hair long, and prefer to be referred to as 'she'. Traditionally they are dancers, but some are also involved in prostitution.

Izzat: Honour

Malishias: Professional massage workers. *Malishia* is an occupational term rather than a term defining sexual practice or identity. Some *Malishias* offer sex services to their customers as well as massage.

Nigehban: Government-run temporary shelter in some districts of Punjab that provide temporary shelter for lost, runaway and kidnapped boys. They provide free food and accommodation, and the children stay there until they can be returned to their families.

Pukhtoon or Pushtoon: A martial race/ethnic group living mainly in the North West Frontier Province, Baluchistan and Afghanistan.

Pukhtoon-wali: The unwritten code of honor followed by *Pukhtoons*.

Pukhtu or Pushtu: The language spoken by Pukhtoon.

Purdah: The Islamic system of covering the head and/or bodies of adult/adolescent women.

Sharam: Shame or dishonor

Sharay Dey: He is a (true) man

Tarnum: Cinema

Ustad: A teacher/trainer who is also master/employer

Zenanas: Also biological males, *zenanas* are not castrated but consider themselves women inside men's bodies. *Zenanas* may or may not feminize their behaviour in public, but commonly wear make up, women's clothes and take on the female role during sex as the penetrated partner.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pakistan's high population growth rate and rapid urbanisation have given rise to more and more children working and living on the streets. This study has found that these children are vulnerable to all forms of abuse including sexual exploitation.

Runaways, school dropouts and illiterate children from poor, often large, sometimes abusive families usually gather at bus terminals and other urban centres because the opportunities for work are plentiful. But the same places present a risk to these children due to the prevalence of sexual exploiters who are aware of their desperate situation.

The main factor pushing these boys into commercial sex is the need for basics such as food, clothing, accommodation and money – and there are many people willing to pay for sex. Most boys forced into prostitution were sexually abused before they entered the commercial sex trade. Children from the Afghan refugee community are particularly vulnerable because of their extreme poverty and a lack of protection and parental supervision. Peer pressure is another important factor, particularly in case of boys with alternative sexual identities; *zenanas* and *chawas* (boys with transvestite and feminine characteristics) make up the majority of boy victims of prostitution in Lahore.

Often boys get money through part-time commercial sex in conjunction with hawking, begging, scavenging, apprenticeships and other informal work. Often boys who work in small hotels and inns near bus terminals and on main highways are forced into prostitution by their employers who recognise the high demand from their guests for boy victims of prostitution. In these cases, the boundaries between sexual abuse and commercial sexual activity are often blurred.

Boys working and living at the main bus terminals in Peshawar and Lahore told the researchers that sexual abuse and exploitation there is widespread. Frequently the abusers and exploiters are their employers and mentors.

Street children working in the sex trade usually hang around busy markets, parks, shrines, cinema halls and other public places where exploiters approach them directly or through pimps. Almost all exploiters are local Pakistani men and they come from all age groups and socio-economic backgrounds.

There is a strict gender segregation and male control of social space and economic resources in Pakistan. Men and women live in virtually separate worlds, particularly in the North West Frontier Province where much of the research for this study was conducted. Gender roles and rules are strictly defined not only in terms of physical space and control but also in terms of social duties and obligations. Transgressions of these rules can lead to severe punishment through stigmatization, social exclusion, physical and emotional abuse and even death. The traditional concepts of *izzat* (honor) and *sharam* (shame or dishonor) construct this form of social control. These are strict cultural concepts and are defined by tradition, custom and values. For example, *sharam* doesn't necessarily mean a wrong or sinful act but is defined as behavior or conduct that brings shame on the family or community. Such value systems can lead to the denial of socially unacceptable behavior including the sexual abuse and exploitation of children.

The practice of keeping boys for sexual gratification by rich and influential men, known as *bachabazi*, is common although it raises difficult questions within communities that consider homosexuality a sexual preference outside social norms.

Existing child protection and rehabilitation services in Pakistan are highly inadequate. There is a dire need for the government to establish such services to address the issue of the commercial sexual exploitation of children in a meaningful way.

There is no mandated system for reporting child sexual exploitation, abuse and neglect, leading to a paucity of reliable statistics and published data on the prevalence of child sexual exploitation, abuse and neglect. The media sometimes but infrequently highlight specific cases of a heinous nature – particularly if a child is sexually abused then murdered – but such reporting can lead to the dangerous assumption that child sexual exploitation and abuse are rare.

Yet in recognition that a problem exists, Pakistan has ratified the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and its two optional protocols, including the Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography. It has also adopted the Stockholm Agenda for Action to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and made a commitment in the Second World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Yokohama in 2001.

The country has a National Plan of Action for Children and regularly reports to the UN convention committee. It also promulgated a child-friendly Juvenile Justice System Ordinance in 2000 under which separate juvenile courts were established nationwide. Besides the NPA, there is also a National Plan of Action against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation.

The issue of the age of a child remains unresolved; Pakistan's laws, the CRC and cultural practices differ on how to define a child. Pakistan has some child protection laws but enforcement is weak. Laws that criminalise prostitution make no distinction between adults and children, meaning that children forced into prostitution are treated as adults in the legal system and face punishment rather than support or protection if convicted. Pakistan's legal system also places the burden of guilt on those selling sex or sexually exploited/abused rather than on those paying for them or those who force or persuade children into prostitution.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Pakistan – Country Profile

Situated at the confluence of South and Central Asia, Pakistan is bordered by Iran and Afghanistan in the west, China in the north, India in the east and the Arabian Sea to the south. The land is geographically diverse with varying climatic conditions and wide-ranging temperatures. The north of the country hosts three of the highest mountain ranges in the world; the Himalayas, the Hindukush and the Karakorum. The Indus River, another prominent physical feature, traverses the entire length of Pakistan and supports the country's complex irrigation system, which is the largest in the world.

Carved out of British India in 1947 on the basis of Muslim nationhood, Pakistan itself was divided in 1971 when, after a bloody war, the biggest ethnic group chose to secede and formed a nation-state of its own – Bangladesh. Pakistan is a federation of four provinces, Baluchistan, the North West Frontier Province, Punjab and Sind. In addition there are the Federally Administered Tribal Areas, Azad Jammu and Kashmir, Federally Administered Northern Areas, and Islamabad Capital Territory. The country is home to many unique linguistic and cultural identities, the predominant ones being Punjabi, Sindhi, Pukhtoon, Baluchi and Seraiki.

The country has a population of 148 million people, and since 1980 has been host to the largest number of refugees in the world, from neighbouring Afghanistan. The unemployment rate in fiscal 2003-2004 was 8.27 percent.¹ According to available estimates, 66.25 percent of men and 41.75% of women are literate, resulting in a national average literacy rate of 54 percent.²

Pakistan has ratified the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and has signed its two optional protocols. It has also adopted the Stockholm Declaration and Agenda for Action, the South Asia Strategy and the Yokohama Global Commitment against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children. It has a National Plan of Action for children. It also reports regularly to the CRC committee. The lead agency for child rights and welfare in the country is the National Commission on Child Welfare and Development (NCCWD). Pakistan promulgated a child-friendly Juvenile Justice System Ordinance in 2000.

1.1.1 General Overview of the Situation for Children in Pakistan

Pakistan has a youthful population, about half of whom are under the age of 20. According to a survey conducted in 1996, 3.6 million children were then engaged in labour in Pakistan.³ A more recent survey found that 40 percent of boys and 25 percent of girls aged 15-17 are working.⁴

¹ Unemployment in Pakistan - A Serious Economic Challenge, AK Aftab, Daily News, 8 August 2004.

² Ibid

³ Pakistan Child Labour Survey, Ministry of Labour, Ferderal Bureau of Statistics and ILO, 1996.

⁴ Population and Poverty - A Briefing, Population Council, Pakistan office, July 2004.

Primary education in Pakistan is characterised by low enrolment and high dropout rates. In rural areas, more than a third of children do not complete primary education.

In Pakistan, there is no mandated system for reporting child exploitation, abuse and/or neglect. There is a paucity of reliable statistics and published data on the prevalence of commercial sexual exploitation of children and child sex abuse in the country. Like other major public health and social problems, it is not easy to document the actual incidence or prevalence of child abuse. It is always difficult to obtain information on sensitive and highly stigmatised issues, and even more difficult when the victims are children. In such a socio-cultural setting, most cases of child abuse, particularly child sex abuse, remain hidden and are not reported to the relevant authorities.

Although the issues of child sexual abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children are shrouded in secrecy, the media sometimes reports on particularly brutal individual cases leading to the general assumption that such incidents are rare.

Another tricky question concerns the relative vulnerability of different categories of children to sexual abuse and exploitation. Some NGOs working on child sexual abuse and exploitation in Pakistan believe that all children, because they are children, are equally vulnerable to abuse, regardless of sex, class, income level and education.. However, there are children who may be more at risk of being sexually abused and exploited, such as those living on the street, refugees, and working children, especially those working in hotels, restaurants and the transport industry.

1.2 International and Regional Policies and Legal Instruments

Pakistan has shown its commitment to all major international and regional instruments to protect the rights of children. The major relevant instruments ratified by Pakistan are as below:

1.2.1 The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and Optional Protocols

Pakistan ratified the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1990, subject to the reservation that "provisions of the convention shall be interpreted in the light of the principles of Islamic laws and values".ⁱ In 1997, Pakistan informed the UN Secretary General that it had decided to withdraw this reservation.

Under Article 34 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child its signatories agree to:

"protect the child from all forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse. For these purposes, state parties shall in particular take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent: (1) the inducement or coercion of a child to engage in any unlawful sexual activity; (2) the exploitative use of children in prostitution or other unlawful sexual practices; (3) the exploitative use of children in pornographic performances and materials".

Pertaining to trafficking, Article 34 notes:

"State parties shall take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form." The Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, adopted by the UN General Assembly and signed by the Pakistan in 2000, further refines the protection of children from sexual exploitation, calling for national measures and legal reforms to make the sale of children and the involvement in child prostitution and child pornography extraditable criminal offences.

The protocol defines child pornography as, "any representation, by whatever means, of a child engaged in real or simulated explicit sexual activities or any representation or the sexual parts of a child for primarily sexual purposes".

Pakistan has ratified the optional protocol.

1.2.2 The Stockholm Declaration and Agenda for Action

The First World Congress against the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, held in Stockholm, Sweden in 1996, for the first time put the issue firmly on the international political agenda. Pakistan was among the 122 states represented in Stockholm, along with representatives from international agencies and non-governmental organizations, service providers, law enforcement agencies and industry. The congress was co-sponsored by the United Nations Children's Fund (Unicef), ECPAT International, the Government of Sweden and the NGO Group for the Convention on the Rights of the Child.

At the end of the five-day meeting, participants adopted a declaration to combat the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

The agenda called for "the development of national agendas for action and indicators of progress, with set goals and time frames for implementation, targeted to reducing the number of children vulnerable to commercial sexual exploitation and nurturing an environment, attitudes and practices responsive to child rights".

The agenda sought better coordination between countries to eliminate the commercial sexual exploitation of children and proposed that they share data collected on victims and perpetrators. It elaborated on sets of concrete recommendations for strategies to combat commercial sexual exploitation of children, categorized under Prevention, Protection, Recovery and Reintegration and Child Participation.

1.2.3 ILO Convention 182 against the Worst Forms of Child Labour

International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention 182, adopted in June 1999, has been ratified by Pakistan. It calls for ILO members to take immediate and effective measures to prohibit and eliminate the worst forms of child labour, including "*the use, procuring or offering of a child for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic performances*".⁵

⁵

CSEC A Review of South Asia, Pakistan Perspective, South Asia Partnership International, 2001, p.10.

In line with the convention, Pakistan recently initiated a programme aimed at eliminating the worst forms of child labour, in collaboration with the ILO and civil society organizations. This programme does not directly address the issue of the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

1.2.4 UN Convention on International Organized Crime

The UN Convention on International Organized Crime, adopted in Palermo, Italy in 2000 was supplemented by an Optional Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children.

The protocol provides a detailed and comprehensive legal definition of trafficking in persons:

"The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of threat or the use of force or other forms of abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation or the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs."

1.2.5 SAARC Convention on Trafficking in Women and Children

The South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) Regional Convention on Combating Trafficking in Women and Children, adopted in Kathmandu, Nepal in 2002 and to which Pakistan is a signatory, invites parties to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women to provide information and statistics on trafficking in women, girls and boys.⁶ The SAARC convention gives a more general definition of trafficking, reflecting the fact that trafficking in women and children does not only occur for sexual purposes.

1.2.6 Yokohama Global Commitment and South Asian Strategy

Organized by Unicef, ECPAT International, the NGO Group of the CRC and the Japanese government, the Second World Congress in 2001 focused on progress in developing national agendas for action and other national and regional policies and legal measures to counter child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

At the end of the congress, the participants adopted the Yokohama Global Commitment in which they re-affirmed their commitment "to developing national agendas, strategies or plans of action … and effective implementation of measures, including child-rights based laws and law enforcement". It expressed the commitment of the signatories to "addressing root causes that put children at risk of exploitation … through comprehensive measures including improved educational access to children, especially girls, … physical and psychological recovery and social reintegration of child victims, and action to criminalize the commercial sexual exploitation of children … while not criminalizing or penalizing the child victims".

Ibid, p.11.

The commitment stresses "adequate resource allocation to counter commercial sexual exploitation of children", adequate measures to protect children from child pornography on the Internet, and a deepened focus on raising awareness and community surveillance of the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

In the process of preparing for the Second World Congress, regional consultations were organized in several locations.

In November 2001 in Dhaka, Bangladesh, governments in the region including Pakistan, as well as international and non-governmental organizations adopted the South Asian Strategy against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Child Abuse. The strategy comprehensively elaborates on the specific concerns in South Asia regarding child sexual exploitation and abuse.

The strategy identifies different groups of children especially vulnerable to sexual exploitation and abuse, and reminds participating governments of their obligation to develop and implement national plans of action in the following two years. "*These plans should, through a consultative process, involving governments and civil society at all levels, including children as active participants, present clear time frames for actions and define effective monitoring mechanisms. They should be revised on a timely basis in light of lessons learned in implementation.*"

The strategy also proposes concrete strategies on the development of an effective and adequate legal framework, including the training of law enforcement personnel, promotion of birth and marriage registration, and child-friendly and gender-sensitive legal procedures. Finally, it proposes specific measures on the inclusion of children and young adults as equal partners in policy and programme design to combat the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

1.3 Structure of the National Plan of Action

The National Policy and Plan of Action was developed through a participatory process from September 2000 to June 2004, involving relevant stakeholders, but excluding children and young people. The lead government agency for the process was the National Commission for Child Welfare and Development (NCCWD), assisted by the Child Rights and Abuses Committee of the Pakistan Pediatric Association (PPA) – an affiliated network member of ECPAT International – and Save the Children Sweden. The National Council of the NCCWD approved the document, which was approved by the Federal cabinet on 24^{th} May, 2006.

The document begins with a one-page statement describing how the proposed policy is anchored on the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Stockholm Declaration and Agenda for Action against the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, and names its three main components: Prevention, Protection, and Recovery and Rehabilitation. The main strategic thrusts of the plan are listed as: political commitment, raising awareness, capacity building, networking, advocacy, social mobilization and setting up and strengthening functional structures and systems. It elaborates on each of the three components, listing the main objectives, how those objectives will be reached, and which national agencies and partner organizations will be responsible for their with implementation.

1.3.1 Prevention

Activities identified were:

- Develop multi-media presentations to raise awareness in the general public;
- Develop culturally appropriate information, education and communication materials on child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children;
- Observe Child Rights Day, November 20, to focus on prevention of all forms of child sex abuse and commercial sexual exploitation of children;
- Use traditional and performing arts, including drama and street theatre, to raise general awareness of the issues;
- Hold workshops and seminars to build the capacity of NGOs and professional groups including doctors, lawyers, teachers and journalists;
- Develop and integrate culturally sensitive programmes to promote awareness of children's rights, gender perspectives, child abuse, personal health and protection education in teacher training and school curricula;
- Develop initiatives to raise awareness of the issues among members of parliament and provincial assemblies;
- Sensitize police and court officials on children's rights, relevant legislation and the need for the special handling of children in police, legal and prison systems;
- Develop programmes to raise awareness of children's rights, child abuse and exploitation aimed at employers and children who work;
- Develop community vigilance systems to watch for cases of child abuse and exploitation within local communities.

1.3.2 Protection

Activities identified were:

- Review existing legislation and develop new laws relating to child protection, specifically to remove inconsistencies in the definition of a child and make all child-related laws conform to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women.
- Review and strengthen the enforcement of child protection laws related to child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children;
- Develop and implement a code of conduct for the operation of children's homes;
- Train law enforcement personnel including police, court officials, public attorneys, prison officials, lawyers and social welfare officers to improve the implementation and enforcement of child protection laws;
- Educate the general public by publicizing laws relating to child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children and the structure to enforce them;
- Conduct situation analysis on child pornography;
- Protect computer literate children from pornography on the web;

• Monitor regional people-trafficking networks through enhanced vigilance and stricter border control.

1.3.3 Recovery and Rehabilitation

Activities identified were:

- Develop a national core group of master trainers in the area of psychosocial recovery and the rehabilitation of victims of child sex abuse and commercial sexual exploitation;
- Develop a training package for service providers including doctors, psychologists, counselors, social workers and staff of children's shelter homes;
- Train service providers to enhance their knowledge and skills and shape their attitudes;
- Establish multi-disciplinary child sexual abuse committees in all major hospitals;
- Establish support services for victims of child sexual abuse and exploitation;
- Develop a referral system for child victims of sexual exploitation and abuse at local government level;
- Publicize services available to child victims of sexual exploitation and abuse and their families;
- Establish a documentation centre on child sexual abuse and exploitation.

1.3.4 Monitoring

A monitoring plan is annexed to the national plan, linking the objectives of the three programme components to strategic activities and their expected outcome. The plan lists indicators of achievement and names the government agencies and partner organizations responsible for each component. No time frame is set and the document is also silent on resource allocation for the implementation of each activity.

1.4 Implementation of the National Plan of Action

Until recently, closed societies of Pakistan did not widely accept and recognise that children could be subject to exploitation and sexual abuse because Pakistan is an ideological nation-state following Islamic precepts. The common perception was that Pakistani society was somehow immune to immorality, and that even if there was such a problem, its magnitude was very small. Given the sensitivity of the issue in Pakistan, the development of the national plan represents a leap forward from denial to acknowledgement and recognition of the problem.

Some important implementation steps undertaken so far include:

- NGOs including Rozan, Sahil, Struggle for Change (SACH), Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA) and Vision have developed and printed material on child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children;
- NCCWD has developed and printed a "Code of Ethics for Media on Reporting of Children's issues", and have formed three media groups to improve the coverage of child

rights related issues, including child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children;

- National Children's Day and Universal Child Rights Day are being observed, but child sexual abuse and exploitation have not been highlighted so far on these occasions;
- Pakistan's president signed a pledge to ensure all rights to Pakistani children, including protection from sexual abuse and exploitation, at a public ceremony on Universal Child Rights Day 2003;
- The government declared 2004 the Year of Child Rights and Welfare in Pakistan and a number of activities took place to raise awareness on child rights and issues surrounding child protection;
- The National Commission for Child Welfare and Development (NCCWD) conducted a national campaign titled "A World Fit for Children", in which HIV/AIDS was linked to child sex abuse;
- NCCWD, Members of the Core Group on Child Sex Abuse and other NGOs have conducted many seminars, symposia and workshops on the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child in collaboration with Unicef, Save the Children Sweden and other donor agencies;
- Sahil, Rozan and the Pakistan Pediatric Association have been imparting personal health and protection education at a limited number of schools in Pakistan's main cities. In 2002-2004, they also did some pioneering work to sensitize police officials on the CRC and child sex abuse;
- All provinces and Islamabad Capital Territory have framed rules for the Juvenile Justice System Ordinance, 2000-2002;
- The government promulgated a new Ordinance on Human Trafficking in 2002;
- The PPA and Save the Children Sweden conducted a study on "Exposure of Children to Pornography at Internet cafés". In 2003, the groups also conducted seminars in all provincial capitals for Internet service providers, café owners and media on the issue of exposure of children to pornography;
- Pakistan Telecommunication Authority has blocked more than 10,000 pornographic web sites and warned Internet café owners to follow a code of conduct;
- The Working Group on Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation had conducted a national study to construct a situational analysis of the commercial sexual exploitation of children in Pakistan, which was completed and published in June 2005.

- In 2002, NCCWD developed a manual on the psychosocial recovery and rehabilitation of victims of child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children in collaboration with Rozan, and other NGOS and Unicef;
- LHRLA, PPA and other members of the core group organized training events for a limited number of professionals, 2002-2004;
- LHRLA launched a help line called "*Madadgar*" for children and women in the southern port city of Karachi;
- Sahil, Rozan, PPA, SACH, Vision and LHRLA are providing services to child sex abuse victims in major cities nationwide.⁷

1.5 Revision of the National Plan of Action

• In order to revise and update the NPA, the NCCWD, UNICEF, Save the Children Sweden and the Working Group on Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation had initiated a participatory process involving all stakeholders. A number of consultations were planned involving children at risk, disabled children, NGOs and other stakeholders. The process was completed and the revised version has been officially approved by the Federal cabinet.

⁷ In depth assessment of the national developments post Yokohama in Pakistan, through implementation of the National Plan of Action against child sexual abuse and exploitation and other initiatives. NCCWD- UNICEF Dec. 2004.

2. BACKGROUND, OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY

2.1 Background

Even though there is widespread awareness of child sexual exploitation by tourists in many areas of South Asia, such as the beach town of Goa in India and Negombo in Sri Lanka, little has been done to study the use of boys for prostitution amongst local perpetrators in the region. A concrete analysis of the dynamics of the gender inequality and gender segregation inherent in South Asia, as well as the cultural factors that differentiate the societal treatment of boy victims from girl victims, is also lacking. Due to the fact that the issue of boy prostitution is a taboo subject across much of the region, and that cases involving sexually exploited boys are frequently underreported and shrouded behind a veil of silence, scarce information has been collected about this problem. As a result, not enough has been done to develop or coordinate programmes to reach out to boys in this region.

The practice of hiring prostituted boys thrives in streets, markets, bus terminals, hotels, restaurants and a variety of other establishments in many provinces of Pakistan. Research conducted in Dhaka, Bangladeshⁱⁱ, Bangalore, India^{iii,iv} and northern Punjab in Pakistan^v has shown that a large number of prostituted boys in these countries are living on the street and that most are also engaged in activities such as garbage scavenging and pick-pocketing. Older men also keep boys for sexual services in a practice called *bachabazi* that is common to the North West Frontier Province of Pakistan.^{vi}

Each day, boys involved in prostitution run the risk of rape, violence, drug abuse, STI infections including HIV/AIDS, and even death. They frequently face harassment and are stigmatised by their communities, particularly if it becomes known that they are having sex with men. Homosexuality is considered socially, culturally and legally unacceptable in most parts of South Asia, and many boys who have sex with men, whether they are homosexual or not, are commonly branded as such.

There are very few programmes that address boy prostitution in South Asia. Most interventions in South Asia that do address this target group are related to HIV/AIDS awareness work. Boy victims of prostitution are generally considered less prone to physical and psychological damage from exploitation than girls, and therefore are generally not thought to be in dire need of specialized rehabilitative services.

ECPAT International realizes that there are still many challenges in addressing the prostitution of boys. Over the past several years, governments, INGOs and NGOs in South Asia have been aware of the problem of the commercial sexual exploitation of children in their countries. Funds have been allocated to implement projects to protect children from commercial sexual exploitation, especially trafficking in women and children, on which a number of research studies have been conducted. However, there is limited interest in collecting data or conducting research on the prostitution of boys, and funding agencies and policymakers often overlook the problem.

Additional situational analyses and research on the prostitution of boys should be conducted so appropriate interventions can be designed.

2.2 Objectives

The overall objectives of this research study were to:

- Collect qualitative information (and quantitative when possible) on the nature, scope and manifestation of the prostitution of boys in Pakistan;
- Analyze the dynamics of gender inequality and segregation as contributing factors to the prostitution of boys, as well as to the societal attitudes toward prostituted boys;
- Identify key actors who affect and/or facilitate the prostitution of boys with an emphasis on perpetration by local actors and study the socio-economic and legal context in which such persons manoeuvre;
- Recommend actions that can be taken at local and national levels to combat the prostitution of boys, based on findings; and
- Recommend regional level actions in collaboration with the other researchers involved in this study.

Situation analysis research was conducted to collect the following information:

a) Basic Socio-economic Context

- Overview of cultural, religious, and social factors that affect the existence of boy prostitution, as well as the pervasiveness of income disparity, class inequality, gender segregation and gender inequality;
- Urban social context of the target areas selected for research.

b) Profile of Boys Vulnerable to Prostitution, as well as Boy Victims of Prostitution

- Typography of boys at risk of being sexually exploited (e.g., age, nationality, gender);
- Typography of sexually exploited boys (e.g., age, where they are from, ethnic background);
- Typography of boys who were sexually exploited and have left prostitution (e.g., age, where they are from, ethnic background);
- Vulnerability factors that push and pull boys into involvement in prostitution (e.g., living conditions, access to education, gender issues, previous abuse, unsupportive family);
- Process by which boys become involved in and leave prostitution (e.g., pervasiveness of an adult male prostitution industry, age at which boys leave or are forced out of prostitution, age at which boys are no longer in demand, obstacles/experiences faced by boys who have left prostitution).

c) Profile of the Environment in which Boys are Sexually Exploited

- An analysis of the organized or informal network in place involving boy prostitution, if such a network exists;
- Vulnerability to sexual and other forms of violence;
- Locations where boys involved in prostitution are sexual exploited (including regions, cities, communities);
- The complicity or indifference of law enforcement officials;
- Relationships with friends/neighbours (e.g., gang members, shop keepers) in a non-sexual context;
- Access to healthcare and support services (particularly related to HIV/AIDS and other STIs);
- Quality of healthcare and support services (particularly expressed by boy victims of prostitution themselves);
- Access to education and information (including on HIV/AIDS and other STIs);
- Vulnerability to drug/alcohol use and abuse.

d) Profile of Sexual Exploiters of Boys Involved in Prostitution

- Typography of exploiters (e.g., age, gender, where they are from, ethnic background, profession, education);
- Frequency that sex exploiters (local perpetrators versus expatriates and sex tourists) visit prostituted boys;
- Method by which sex exploiters find access to prostituted boys;
- Analysis of where sex exploiters come from (e.g. if they travel to exploit boys or do it within their own communities);
- Depending on whether direct interviews with sex exploiters of boys can be obtained:
 - Analysis of whether sex exploiters specifically seek out boys, or do not necessarily prefer them to girls, women, or men;
 - Analysis of whether sex exploiters were themselves once victims of violence and/or sexual abuse.

e) Social, Cultural, and Gender Context

- Analysis of the dynamics of gender segregation and gender inequality as factors behind the prostitution of boys;
- Analysis of the cultural and societal methods for raising and educating boys relative to girls within the family and in the school system;
- Comparison of discrimination against boy victims of prostitution relative to girl victims;
- Awareness of society on the existence of the prostitution of boys;
- Reactions/attitudes toward the practice, boy victims of prostitution themselves, and toward local boy child sex abusers;
- Availability and access to boys in comparison to girls.

f) Responses to the Problem

- Acknowledgement of the problem amongst government agencies, nongovernmental agencies (NGOs), academics, media and the public;
- Responses by the government and the type of actions taken;

- Legal status of prostitution within the country, responses by law enforcement bodies, and analysis of how boys are protected under the law especially concerning whether they are prosecuted or perceived as victims;
- Main non-government organizations working to combat the prostitution of boys:
 - Activities and projects relating to the prostitution of boys, whether completed, presently in place, or planned;
 - Description of capacity and linkages with government, international organizations and other NGOs;
 - Contact information;
- Acknowledgement of the prostitution of boys by family members, and their responses and attitudes toward the problem.

g) Recommendations and Defined Priorities

- Trends in the prostitution of boys in the selected target area, as well as in the country at large;
- Priorities to be defined for effective response;
- Types of actions which government should undertake to address the issue;
- Aspects of legal reform needed to prevent and protect boys from prostitution;
- Aspects of institutional reform needed to provide effective recovery and rehabilitative services for boy victims of prostitution;
- Present and potential roles of NGOs in addressing boy prostitution.

2.3 Methodology

The research team focussed on two target areas, Lahore in Punjab province and Peshawar in North West Frontier Province (NWFP), in which evidence of boy prostitution exists.

Researchers collected data through a Rapid Appraisal Method, utilizing individual interviews, community-based interviews and focus groups; literature reviews; court proceedings, police records, relevant legislation and lack thereof; news events; and the historical background of commercial sexual exploitation of children within the country and/or target area.

Information was collected at various levels in order to address the conceptual spaces that give shape to the commercial sexual exploitation of children (e.g., individual, family, community, social, structural, cultural). Information was therefore compiled on individuals (children, pimps and exploiters, child sex abusers), families (of child victims), communities (where victims come from or where exploitation takes place), and structural and cultural aspects of these communities.

In order to collect qualitative information, in-depth interviews and focus group discussions were conducted with NGOs; boy victims of prostitution; government agencies; social workers and officials from organizations providing care and protection to children, particularly child victims of commercial sexual exploitation; boys' institutions; co-educational schools; judicial officials responsible for the persecution of crimes such as the corruption of minors and child procurement; migration authorities and border police; hotel owners/staff and shopkeepers; local community and religious leaders; local journalists; child rights advocates and academics; and other relevant informants.

2.3.1 Data Types_

Data gathered for the purpose of this study:

a) Primary qualitative data/information was gathered using rapid assessment techniques like focus group discussions (FGDs), walk-through surveys and in-depth interviews;

b) Review of secondary data sources: existing research studies and reports, policy documents, and international, regional and national legal instruments.

2.3.2 Data Collection

Considering the time and resource constraints, the research team made a selection of research sites in rural and urban areas in localities where prostitution of boys is believed to be occurring. After consultation with ECPAT International, the North West Frontier Province was selected for the rural perspective – a relatively traditional and conservative area with a large refugee population from neighboring Afghanistan. Lahore, the capital of Punjab and the second largest city in Pakistan, was selected as the main urban research site.

A team of trained social workers and pediatricians undertook data collection, coordinated by a team leader, the chairman of the Child Rights and Abuse Committee of the Pakistan Pediatric Association (CRAC-PPA), assisted by a co-researcher, the focal person of CRAC-PPA Punjab chapter. The ECPAT International Secretariat provided technical and financial assistance. The data collection was carried out during 2004-2005. The following table briefly summarizes the activities undertaken for data collection:

Activity	Place
FGD Community leaders	Swabi district, NWFP
FGD Adolescent boys	Village Tehkal district, Peshawar, NWFP
Walk-through survey	Haji Camp Bus Terminal, Peshawar City
Walk-through survey of runaway children	Minar Park, Lahore
FGD Massage boys	Lahore
FGD Chawas/Zenanas	Lahore
Interview with crime reporter	Peshawar City
Interview with service provider at a drop-in centre	Lahore
Review of literature and legislation	Peshawar
Researchers' meeting	Peshawar
Walk-through survey, bus	Lorry Adda, Lahore

2.3.3 Research Activities Conducted

terminal		
FGD with vulnerable	Lahore	
adolescents		
Researchers' meeting	Lahore	

a) Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)

On average, 8-15 persons were invited to all focus group discussions. Separate FGDs were organized for vulnerable/at risk children and victims of commercial sexual exploitation of children. The FGDs were organized and conducted by trained facilitators and data collectors. The facilitators, with the help of local contacts, selected the respondents. The ages of child respondents ranged from 10 years to 17 years.

Each group was given a brief pre-discussion briefing on the purpose, process and norms of the discussions. The process of all discussions with children and adolescents began with a session in which all participants were asked to introduce themselves and give some personal information, such as how they spend their days.

After building an initial rapport, the facilitators asked specific questions, according to the FGD protocol for each group. Given the sensitivity of the subject matter, the initial segment was kept general and related to enlarging knowledge on the situation of children in Pakistan. The facilitators gradually and cautiously proceeded to bring out opinions and perceptions on the issues surrounding the prostitution of boys. There was usually confusion at the beginning of the discussions on the differences between child sexual abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children. The facilitators explained the differences before taking the discussions further.

The following tables show the type of questions asked by the facilitators. More probing questions were asked whenever the need arose during discussions.

Types of Questions Asked to Children/Adolescents

- Who is a child?
- What are the rights and obligations of children?
- How are children treated inside and outside your community/family?
- How do you relate to your parents? To peers (boys/girls)?
- What types of good and bad treatment are you aware of, and how do they make boys feel?
- Are you aware of boy prostitution in your area and why boys fall into prostitution?
- What suggestions do you have on ways in which children and adults can make life better for children and combat the bad treatment of children?

Focus Group Discussion with Community leaders in NWFP

The focus group discussions were conducted at Swabi, some 100 kilometres from the provincial capital Peshawar. Fourteen men (four village councillors, three religious leaders and seven clan heads) participated in the discussion.

Topics of Discussion with community leaders

- Perceptions of parenthood and family structures;
- Ideas surrounding childhood and the participation of children in decision-making on matters affecting children;
- Gender relations in the community and the family;
- Types of punishment or maltreatment of children.

b) Walk-through Surveys

Three walk-through surveys (informal small group discussions and semi-structured interviews and direct observations) were conducted with different groups of boys, victimized by/vulnerable to sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation. These boys were informally approached by researchers in the vicinity of their working localities, including boys living on the street (Karim Park, Lahore) and boys working in the transport industry and in bus terminals (in Peshawar and Lahore) – locations commonly perceived to be associated with prostitution of boys. On average, 10-12 boys, aged 12 years to 17 years, were interviewed per survey location.

Type of Questions Asked

- How do adults in daily life treat children?
- Can you mention good and bad types of treatment of children?
- What are especially difficult/dangerous aspects of the daily life of your friends?
- What do you like most about your own life? What do you dislike?
- How do you get money necessary for your living?
- How do you suggest children and adults can make life better for children in especially difficult circumstances, and what can they do to combat bad treatment of children?

c) Individual Interviews

Informal interviews were held with key informants: stakeholders, duty bearers and service providers. The informants included the chief executive of Vision, doctors at a drop-in centre for men who have sex with men, an official of *Nigehban*, which runs temporary shelters for runaway children, and an investigative journalist.

2.3.4 Data Analysis

The researchers and field interviewers in Lahore and Peshawar did the initial data analysis. The final analysis, synthesis and report writing was done by the lead researcher in the light of feedback and guidelines provided by the ECPAT International Secretariat, Bangkok.

2.4 Limitations of the Study

As with all rapid assessments, the current study is limited in the range of the topics covered and the extent to which these findings can be generalized beyond the communities surveyed. Resources were simply too limited and the study timeframe too constrained to conduct the type of broad national survey required to accurately capture the incidence rates and detailed dynamics of the existing trends. Most of the street-based data came from participant observation, which by definition entails objective interpretation and therefore the potential for bias. In order to maximize the rigor of the data, a pair of researchers conducted each observation and carefully documented the findings. The data summarized in this report came from a limited number of geographic locations and it would be hard to generalize if the attitudes, behaviors and trends that are reported reflect a uniform national picture. Despite these limitations, this effort represents one of the first attempts to explore the issue of the prostitution of boys in a scientific way in Pakistan and could serve as a basis and starting point for constructing a comprehensive picture of the commercial sexual exploitation of children in the country.

2.5 Ethical Considerations

According to the existing social and religious value systems, sex is a taboo subject in Pakistan and any discussion of sex-related matters is considered dirty and immoral. This context necessitated the development of strict ethical guidelines for this study. All participants were treated with dignity and respect, and participation in the study was voluntary. Informed verbal consent was obtained from all participants prior to their participation. Respondents were able to end their participation in the research at any time during the process. Researchers were sufficiently trained to provide psychosocial support to children if the need arose. The appropriate locations for the FGDs and interviews in the community were selected in consultation with children and local contacts. Children were monetarily compensated for their participation in the research activities.

3. SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONTEXT

3.1 Research Locations

3.1.1 Lahore

Lahore is a metropolitan city in Punjab with strong modernizing influences and is recognized as the cultural and fashion capital of Pakistan. It is also the favorite destination of runaway children from all parts of the country, and is home to a famous and centuries-old red-light district known as Heera Mandi (Diamond market).

During the Zia Ul Haque regime in 1979, the *Hudood* Ordinance imposed tough regulations in red-light areas to curb the sex industry. This prompted many prostitutes to move from red-light districts to residential areas where they continued to operate, in secret through a network of pimps and contacts. Yet some people involved in prostitution remain in the red-light districts, including in Heera Mandi, while others, including boys. operate from streets, hotels, parks and other public places. Boys specifically do not sell sex in Heera mandi. As Heera Mandi and surrounding locations are the contact and pick-up points.

Heera Mandi, a dense cluster of concrete and semi-concrete houses, is still well known for its organized and institutionalized prostitution. The area begins at Taxali Gate, where Bazare-Sheikhupurian starts, and spreads to *Taranum* (cinema) *Chowk*, also known as *Chakla* (brothel) *Chowk*.

Low-rate prostitutes and their pimps operate in an area called Sabz Pir Wali Gali, while dancing girls and more expensive prostitutes are found in Hydree Street, Kuch-e-Shahbaz and Cheet Ram Road.

Many of the girls under the age of 18 who operate in Heera Mandi sell sex under the guise of dancing girls and dance students. Researchers found that a majority of those girls are the daughters and relations of other prostitutes working in the area. A majority of them are inovolved in prostitution only in the daytime – traveling in from other parts of Lahore or small adjacent cities – and return home in the evening

3.1.2 Peshawar, North West Frontier Province

The North West Frontier Province is situated at the northwestern tip of Pakistan bordering Afghanistan, and Peshawar is the provincial capital and main metropolitan centre. NWFP, with a population of almost 22 million, is home to ethnic *Pukhtoons* or *Pushtoons*, who follow their own code of life and honor. A large number of refugees from neighboring Afghanistan live in Peshawar and other parts of NWFP. There are no designated red-light areas in Peshawar or anywhere else in the province.

3.2 Gender Dynamics

Pakistani society is patriarchal and most of the socio-economic space is owned and controlled by men. Islam has been adapted in Pakistan to serve the primordial ideology of male domination, and attempts to modernize have posed a challenge. Under the British rule, men had to adapt. They had to learn to speak English and wear western-style clothes in order to earn living. To compensate for this desecration, and because of the conservative ethical norms within the closed societies, they forced their women to become symbols of Oriental/Indian femininity.

Existing cultural norms and religious beliefs dictate different attitudes towards males and females with respect to adolescent and youth sexuality and sexual practices. For women, sex outside marriage is considered socially unacceptable and tradition continues to place a high premium on female virginity at the time of marriage. In contrast, young men are not held to the same standard and for them sex before marriage, while not condoned socially, is more accepted.

While traditional concepts are transforming fast in metropolitan Lahore, changes elsewhere in the province are much slower. Men dominate the *Pukhtoon* world in which masculinity is always praised in social discourse. It is a chauvinistic society that revolves around the concept of manliness (*saritob*). The greatest compliment you can pay a Pukhtoon man is to say he is "*saray dey*" (a man). Women too are praised for their masculinity; if called "*nara khaza da*", a woman is being complimented for her manliness.

Sons have always been the most important children in a *Pukhtoon* family, and the birth of a boy is heralded with gunfire and merry making. Culturally, the code of honor requires a Pukhtoon to adopt a protective role towards his women folk. The easiest and most convenient means of achieving this is by segregating females (*purdah*) so that they are barely visible to people outside the family.

The construction of gender relationships, sex and sexuality is very complex in NWFP where there is strict gender segregation and men control the social space and economic resources. Gender roles and rules are strictly defined not only in terms of physical space and control but also in terms of social duties and obligations. Transgressions of these rules can lead to severe punishment through stigmatization, social exclusion, physical and emotional abuse and even death. The traditional concepts of *izzat* (honor) and *sharam* (shame or dishonor) support this form of social control. These concepts have strict cultural definitions, for example, *sharam* doesn't necessarily mean a wrongful or sinful act but is defined by behavior and conduct that brings shame to the family or community as a whole. Traditions, customs and values define these precepts.

Men and women virtually live in separate worlds in most of rural NWFP due to strict gender segregation. Family (biological and extended) is considered a strictly private domain and no outside intervention is accepted or tolerated. Parents have full control over their children and adulthood is conferred only by marriage. Adolescent boys are not considered men until they marry. Before that, they are 'beardless youth' and are considered sexually available to other men. Male homo-sociability and homo-affectionalism exist and are socially tolerated. Many men have unfulfilled sexual urges because romantic relationships with women are so distant due to the

strict sexual segregation. There are very few socially acceptable outlets for men to relieve these emotional and sexual desires. Many men therefore form intense homo-affectional friendships with other men, which can include extensive touching, body contact and sharing of beds. Such practices, although perceived as bad and shameful by the society are largely tolerated. Any relationship outside marriage with o a women is considered sin in the Islamic society and is not tolerated, however friendship among males is largely accepted

In the gender-segregated societies of Lahore and Peshawar, adult men and women cannot meet each other openly, and children are the only people who can have contact with males and females without causing alarm. The association of male adults with boys therefore does not come under strict scrutiny, making male children vulnerable to sexual exploitation. Moreover, the common myth that boys are physically and emotionally stronger than girls also plays an important role in not recognizing the complexities and vulnerabilities associated with their sexual exploitation. Likewise, the fact that boys cannot get pregnant through sexual exploitation reduces the possibility of them being spurned by society for the abuse they suffer. As a result, the issue has been under-recognized or not acknowledged at all and no effective action has been taken to prevent the sexual exploitation of boys.

3.3 Class and Ethnic Dynamics

While the sex exploiters of boys come from all ethnic groups and social classes, most prostituted boys themselves hail from poor and lower-middle class families.

The incidence of poverty is on the rise in Pakistan, despite steady economic progress and the improvement of macro-economic indicators. While the top 20 percent of Pakistani households earn more than 40 percent of the nation's income, the 40 percent of homes at the bottom of the socio-economic scale bring in only about 20 percent of the national total.⁸

That problem is compounded by the existence of a feudal system in many rural areas. Pakistan's poor not only earn less, but they also lack access to basic necessities such as education, health, clean drinking water and proper sanitation. Their poverty is perceived to be the root cause of many social problems including the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

NGOs working on child sex abuse and sexual exploitation have said rising unemployment rates are prompting families to push their children to work. Families may also send their children to areas where they have a better chance of finding a job, thus sometimes inadvertently exposing their offspring to the risk of exploitation and abuse.

Most of the boy victims in the mass sexual exploitation and murder of 100 children in Lahore by Javaid Iqbal, uncovered in December 1999, came from large families belonging to low-income groups. Almost all of the victims' families said they had not been very concerned about where the

⁸

Population and Poverty - Briefing Paper, Population Council, Pakistan office, July 2004.

boys were working and that it was enough that the boys were working productively and contributing to the household income.⁹

According to community leaders, worsening economic conditions have resulted in rising unemployment in rural NWFP. An important consequence of this economic deterioration and adult unemployment has been the increasing prevalence of child labor and an increase in the number of boys forced into prostitution.¹⁰

The province's refugee community has been even worse hit by the pressing economic situation and lack of access to social services. After the Soviet invasion in 1978, more than 4.5 million Afghans took refuge in Pakistan, Iran and other neighboring countries. Most of them left behind the support of their extended families, friends, traditional values and familiar ways of life. With limited means and external support, they have been forced to face new and uncertain situations. At a focus group discussion in Peshawar, the key Afghan informants and adolescents admitted that the commercial sexual exploitation of children is more pervasive than most people realise, and that limited economic opportunities have led to increases in child labour and the number of children forced into prostitution. The adolescent boys said street children often get picked up by men and are sexually exploited in return for money. Some 10.1 percent of Afghans knew children in their communities, most of them boys, who sold sex for money.¹¹

3.4 Societal Attitudes Towards the Prostitution of Boys

Social attitudes towards the prostitution of boys have not been well researched in Pakistan but by and large it is considered bad and sinful. Existing value systems, particularly in NWFP, lead to the denial of socially unacceptable behavior, including child sexual abuse and child prostitution. In many cultures around the world, a sense of guilt plays a central role in controlling personal behavior. In Pukhtoon culture (NWFP), while a measure of guilt does exist, shame is a much stronger factor, and for the shame to exist, the behavior must be public. A well-known Pushtu wish, "*Bey pardeh ma shey*" (may you never be uncovered), clearly testifies to this perception. The phrase implies that in the eyes of God your honor remains intact so long as any shameful or sinful acts are kept secret.

During focus group discussions, community leaders admitted they were aware that some men have 'friendships' with young boys (*bachabazi*) and that it is commonly understood that they have sex. In return, the boys may be paid money or compensated in kind. The community leaders opined that it is a wrong and sinful practice but admitted that it is tolerated – a double standard that they lamented. But the implication seems to be that while it is disgraceful to be a passive agent (receptive partner) in a homosexual relationship, it is a matter of male pride and power to be an active agent (insertive partner). *Bachbabazi* relationships are not perceived as

⁹ Confronting Reality. A Situational Analysis of Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse in Pakistan -- The Mass Murderer of Lahore, PPA-SC Sweden, 2000.

¹⁰ Protection Assessment Among Refugees and Host Communities in Major Urban Areas of Pakistan (NWFP Report), PPA-UNICEF, 2002.

Ibid.

prostitution by society at large because the boy offers sexual services to only one man as opposed to any man prepared to pay for the service.

4. LEGAL PROTECTION

Pakistan has a comprehensive set of federal and provincial laws pertaining to children, all relating to different policy areas:¹² employment, education, juvenile justice and guardians. As a general rule, federal laws override provincial laws pertaining to the same issue. Certain laws cover sexual exploitation and abuse of children, but no single law deals specifically with the different aspects of (the suppression of) violence against children. In practice, violations of children's rights, child sex abuse and the exploitation and trafficking of children are mostly covered by the outdated Penal Code and the more recent Hudood Ordinance.

Whereas in recent years the legal framework has been strengthened, particularly in relation to juvenile justice and the trafficking of persons, the absence of laws concerning violence against children including the commercial sexual exploitation of children has translated into poor legal protection for children. The complex question of age, brought about by the inconsistent legal definition of a child within and between the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), national laws, customary laws and cultural practices is still unresolved. In the absence of a uniform legal definition of a child, it is hard to appreciate the seriousness of the government's efforts to devise and design child protection policies. There are some child protection laws but enforcement is weak. Laws that criminalize prostitution make no distinction between adults and children. This not only places the burden of guilt on the victims of prostitution rather than the perpetrators, but also doubly penalizes the children by treating them as adults in the legal system and subjecting them to punishment rather than support or protection.

Pakistan's police force is underpaid, overworked and lacks resources, making it an easy target for bribery and corruption. In addition, ,ost police officers are not aware of the existing child protection laws and 'child-friendly' policies.

As a follow-up to the World Summit for Children in 1990, the Government of Pakistan developed a National Plan of Action for Children 1990-2000. Following the 2002 UN special Session on Children, an NPA was prepared. The goals and targets as set forth by the outcome document "A World Fit for Children" will be reflected in the new NPA. The new NPA intends to

¹² The most important national and provincial laws relevant to child prostitution and sexual abuse are the following: The Code of Criminal Procedure; the North-West Frontier Province Orphanages; the Pakistan Penal Code (1860); the Female Infanticide Prevention Act (1870); the Reformatory Schools Act (1897); the Punjab Suppression of Immoral Traffic Act (1935); the Vagrancy (Karachi Division) Act (1950); the West Pakistan Control of Orphanage Act (1958) and Rules (1958); the Probation of Offenders Ordinance (1960); the Punjab Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance (1961); the West Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance (1961); the Indecent Advertisements Prohibition Act (1963); the West Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution (Amendment) Act (1968); the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan (1973); the Supervision and Control Act (1976); the Travel Agencies Act (1976); the Pakistan Tourist Guides Act (1976); the Sindh Orphanages (Supervision and Control) Act (1976); the Offence of Zina (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance (1979); the Punjab Children Ordinance (1983), the Enforcement of Shariah Act (1991); the Employment of Children Act (1991); the Abolition of the Punishment of Whipping Act (1996); the Juvenile Justice System Ordinance (2000); and the Ordinance to Prevent and Control Human Trafficking (2002).

address the situation of exploited children, including physical and psychological recovery and social integration. The NPA intends to provide strategies for improved protection as well as monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. Apart from the NPA for children, an NPA for women, including a chapter on the girl child, was adopted. The NPA against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation was revised by the National Commission for Child Welfare and Development (NCCWD) in collaboration with Unicef, Save the Children Sweden and the Pakistan Pediatric Association (PPA). The NPA was adopted by the Federal Cabinet in May 2006.

In Pakistan's legal system, protection of the child is anchored on the constitution and family codes, pertaining to the social welfare of children and women inside the family. The law considers the family the fundamental unit of society. The Constitution of Pakistan declares that all citizens are equal before the law and are entitled to equal protection under the law. Article 3 of the constitution provides for the elimination of exploitation. The following forms of non-discrimination are addressed by the constitution: equality before the law; the special protection for women and children; the entitlement of minorities to education in their own religion; and the entitlement to basic necessities due to disability. Several articles of the constitution provide for the legal protection of the child against discrimination.

Pakistan's laws that could be used to prosecute cases involving child prostitution, child trafficking for sexual purposes, and child pornography are contained in a variety of provisions that inconsistently protect children. In particular, the *Hudood* Ordinance can punish child victims of commercial sexual exploitation rather than protect them.

4.1 Child Prostitution

The prevention of prostitution is a principle of policy under Clause 37 of the Constitution of Pakistan.¹³ Brothels and public soliciting for prostitution are illegal in Pakistan and it is illegal to procure or entice women, regardless of age, to engage in prostitution or to profit from a woman's prostitution. It is also a criminal offence under the Penal Code, which makes abduction, trafficking and procuring of children under the age of 18 for the purposes of prostitution punishable by 10 years imprisonment or fine or both. The Provincial Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance (1961) prohibits the attraction, attention by words, gestures, willful and indecent exposure of the body for the purpose of prostitution of a girl under 16 years of age. The ordinance prohibits brothels, and makes it illegal to keep or detain any woman against her will, at any place, with intent to force her to have sexual intercourse with any man other than her lawful husband. These laws apply to girls and women only and are irrelevant as far as the prostitution of boys is concerned.

Sodomy as a crime is covered by the Pakistan Penal Code in Section 337, which states that "whomever, intending or voluntarily has carnal intercourse against the order of nature with any man, woman or animal shall be punished with imprisonment for life, or with imprisonment of either description for a term which shall not be less than two years nor more than ten years and

¹³ Sexually Abused and Sexually Exploited Children and Youth in Pakistan, UN Economic Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP)/Government of Japan/NCCWD, 2001, p.3.

shall also be liable to a fine". The minimum sentence for sodomy is two years and the maximum ten years.

Pakistan has two laws that address sex with children: the Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961, and the Offence of Zina (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance, 1979 (*Hudood* Ordinance).

Under the Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, it is illegal for a person who has custody, charge or care of a girl under 16 years of age to cause, encourage or abet her seduction or prostitution; punishment may be up to three years' imprisonment and a fine up to Rs.1,000 (US\$ 17), and, if the offender is male, a whipping.^{vii} This law also prohibits procuring, enticing, leading away or attempting to procure, entice or lead away any woman or girl for purposes of prostitution, with or without her consent; or, persuading a woman or girl to leave her usual place of abode, with the intent that, for purposes of prostitution, she becomes the "intimate" of or frequents a brothel.^{viii} Punishment may be up to three years' imprisonment, and, if the offender is male, a whipping that is in lieu of or in addition to any other punishments provided under this ordinance.^{ix} In addition, the law prohibits keeping a women or girl against her will, with the intent that she will have sex with a man other than her lawful husband; punishment may be up to three years' imprisonment, a fine up to Rs.1,000, and, if the offender is male, a whipping.^x

The *Hudood* Ordinance targets and punishes sex outside of marriage and its definition of an adult woman brings early teenage girl children within its scope. The law defines a female at least 16 years of age or having attained puberty as an adult,^{xi} and prohibits sex between a man and a woman who are not married to each other.^{xii} Punishment for an adult Muslim married man or woman is death by stoning, while punishment for unmarried adult men and women is a public whipping.^{xiii} If these punishments are not enforceable in a given case, the offender may be punished by up to 10 years' imprisonment, a whipping, and fine.^{xiv}

The law also punishes sex outside of a valid marriage where it is against the will or without the consent of the victim; or, with the consent of the victim where consent was obtained by fear of death or hurt, or consent was given because the victim believed that s/he is validly married to the offender.^{xv} Punishment for an adult Muslim married man or woman is death by stoning, while punishment for unmarried adult men and women is a public whipping and any other punishment, including death.^{xvi} Where the offender is not an adult, however, punishment may be up to five years' imprisonment, or a fine, or both, and a whipping.^{xvii} Furthermore, if these punishments are not enforceable in a given case, the offender may be punished by between four and 25 years' imprisonment and a whipping.^{xviii}

If the offender does not confess the crime, proof requires four adult male Muslim eyewitnesses to the act of penetration; if the offender is non-Muslim, the eyewitnesses may be non-Muslim.^{xix} Punishment shall not be enforced if an offender's confession or the testimony of an eyewitness is recanted.^{xx}

While the Prostitution Ordinance punishes acts related to child prostitution – for example, encouraging, procuring, or causing the seduction or prostitution of girls – the law fails to define child prostitution or punish the act of having sex with a child for remuneration. This law also fails to protect all boy children and offers only limited protection to girl children between 16 years and

18 years, all of whom are equally if not more vulnerable to child prostitution. For all of these reasons, this law falls short of the international standards set forth in the CRC and its Optional Protocol.

The *Hudood* Ordinance is even more troubling because of the draconian punishments it imposes on early teenage girl children who may be classified as offenders within the scope of this law. As discussed above, the *Hudood* Ordinance defines an adult woman as a female at least 16 years of age or who has attained puberty; thus, girls who reach puberty earlier than 16 years of age are adults under this law, and married and unmarried 'adults' who have sex outside marriage may be punished. As a result, girl children forced into prostitution who are 16 years and older or have attained puberty may be punished with death by stoning if they are married, and with a whipping if they are unmarried, or subject to terms of imprisonment and other punishments.

Moreover, the *Hudood* Ordinance's provision that could be used to prosecute those who force children into prostitution – the crime of having sex outside marriage against a person's will – has an enormous evidentiary barrier: four adult males must be eyewitnesses to the crime, unless the offender confesses. As a practical matter, it would be difficult, if not impossible, to find four eyewitnesses to any crime, let alone a crime involving sex with children. Consequently, this evidentiary requirement makes this provision virtually useless in cases involving child prostitution. As a whole, the *Hudood* Ordinance hinders the protection of children against prostitution and is completely contrary to the CRC, which Pakistan has ratified, and the Optional Protocol, which Pakistan has signed.

Two provincial laws have been adopted to provide legal protection to children, although they specify different ages for different crimes. The Punjab Children Ordinance (1983) and the Sindh Children Act (1955) prohibit allowing children between the ages of 4 years and 16 years to frequent a brothel, or to abet, cause or encourage the seduction or prostitution of a girl under the age of 16 years, or encourage anyone other than her husband to have sexual intercourse with her.

4.2 Child Pornography

Child pornography is insufficiently covered by the national legal system. Pakistan has not enacted specific legislation to combat child pornography. Adult and child pornography are not differentiated and child pornography falls under a general ban on obscene materials.

Clause 37 of the Constitution of Pakistan provides that the state shall prevent the printing, publication, circulation and display of obscene literature and advertisements. Sections 292, 294 and 298 of the Pakistan Penal Code make it an offence to sell, let to hire, distribute, exhibit or circulate any obscene literature, including any book, pamphlet, paper, drawing, painting, representation or figure. Under the Penal Code, child pornography falls under a general ban on obscene material. Although there is no clear definition of obscenity, the Penal Code prohibits making, producing or possessing an obscene book, pamphlet, paper, drawing, painting, representation, figure or object for sale, letting to hire, public distribution, exhibition, or circulation.^{xxi} Importing, exporting or conveying any obscene object for any of the foregoing purposes, or knowing that any of the foregoing will take place, is also punishable,^{xxii} as is

receiving profits from any business where a person knows or has reason to believe that obscene objects will be made, produced, kept, imported, exported, conveyed, publicly exhibited or circulated.^{xxiii} Lastly, advertising that a person is engaged in or ready to engage in any of the acts or that a person can procure an obscene object is an offence.^{xxiv} All of these activities may be punished with up to three months in prison, or a fine, or both.^{xxv}

It is unclear whether this obscenity law applies to child pornographic images as defined by the Optional Protocol – images depicting a child engaged in real or simulated explicit sexual activities or any representation of the sexual parts of a child for primarily sexual purposes.^{xxvi} Even if it does, it does not include electronic or digital images, audio recordings or simulated images, nor does it punish the possession of such images or recordings. Thus, Pakistani law does not meet international standards against child pornography.

There is no specific law that provides protection to children who are exploited to produce pornography or exposed to pornography. Moreover, legal provisions have not been updated to include crimes relating to the development, distribution, possession or exposure to pornographic material on the Internet.

4.3 Child Marriage and Birth Registration

The Child Marriages Restraint Act (1929) prohibits the marriage of children under the ages of 18 for boys and 16 for girls. This law lacks proper implementation, and the traditional practice of early marriage persists, especially of rural girls including the large Afghan refugee population. Moreover, as the Death, Birth and Marriage Registration Act (1890) is not widely adhered, a large number of children remain unregistered at birth and many marriages are not registered, thereby hampering the legal protection of children, especially of girls. Under the Dissolution of Muslim Marriages Act (1939), a girl whose marriage was arranged by her guardian can repudiate the marriage upon the attainment of puberty. In practice, however, societal norms and legal complications make it virtually impossible for minors to repudiate a marriage.

The legal obligation to register children at birth is provided by the Births, Deaths and Marriages Registration Act (1886), the Cantonment Act (1924), the National Registration Act (1973) and the NADRA (National Data Registration Authority) Act (2000). However, there is a general lack of awareness in society regarding the importance of registering children at birth, as well as on the increased legal protection this provides to children and adults throughout their lives. As a consequence, birth registration rates in Pakistan are low, as in other parts of South Asia.

To improve the system of birth registration in the country, the government has constituted a National Committee on the Registration of Children at Birth. Local government institutions responsible for birth registration have, under instruction from the government, initiated a process of reviewing their by-laws so as to remove bottlenecks and simplify the registration procedure.

4.4 Child Sexual Abuse

Most child abuse cases in Pakistan are registered under the Offence of *Zina-bil-jabr* (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance of 1979. The ordinance makes it a crime to kidnap or abduct any girl or woman with the intent to compel her to marry any person against her will or to force or seduce her to have intercourse; and to sell, let to hire, or otherwise to dispose any person with intent that such person at any time be employed or used for the purpose of prostitution or illicit intercourse with any person or for any unlawful and immoral purpose. The ordinance provides for punishments ranging from life imprisonment, to flogging not exceeding 30 strikes, to a fine.

The *Hudood* Ordinance defines the person committing an offence as any male of at least 18 years and any female of at least 16 years, or any person having reached puberty. To prove an offence has been committed, a confession by the accused or the testimony of four Muslim male witnesses must be provided. In practice, girls will find it difficult to provide the necessary proof of rape under the ordinance, and in the case of married girls under 14 years of age, they may be accused of adultery instead. Both instances indicate a serious anomaly in the capacity of the *Hudood* Ordinance to provide appropriate legal protection for children.

4.5 Trafficking of Children

Pakistan is a country of origin, transit and destination for human trafficking, including the trafficking of children. It is the destination point for those being trafficked from Bangladesh and Myanmar, the transit point for those brought in from the Far East and Bangladesh to be taken elsewhere, and the recruiting ground for those that are internally trafficked or sent to Gulf states.¹⁴

The Pakistan Penal Code criminalizes kidnapping, abduction, or inducing a woman to compel her to marriage; to procure a minor girl under 18; or to import a girl under the age of 21 from abroad with the intent that she may be or knowing that it be likely that she will be, forced or seduced to illicit intercourse with another person (Section 366) with a punishment of up to 10 years imprisonment. But this law doesn't cover boys, thus leaving them unprotected.

Kidnapping a child under 10 years is punishable with death under the Penal Code. Section 370 criminalizes buying or disposing of any person as slaves or dealing in slaves, and Sections 399 and 340 prohibit wrongful confinement and restraint.

The Constitution of Pakistan provides for security, safeguards to arrest and detention, and prohibits slavery and forced labour as fundamental rights. Despite these legal provisions, most trafficking cases are tried under the Passport Act, which imposes very low fines.

¹⁴

Trafficking of Women and Children in South Asia and Within Pakistan, a national study, p. 63.

Pakistan has three laws that address human trafficking: the Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002 (Trafficking Ordinance); the Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961; and the Offence of *Zina* (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance, 1979.

Under the Trafficking Ordinance, trafficking is defined as kidnapping, abducting, using coercion, or giving or receiving any payment or benefit for a person's transport into or out of Pakistan, to buy, sell, recruit, detain, harbour, obtain, secure, or receive a person, with or without their consent.^{xxvii} The law punishes planning or executing a plan of trafficking to attain any benefit for purposes of exploitative entertainment, among other things.^{xxviii} Exploitative entertainment includes sexual practices or sex.^{xxix} Planning to commit a trafficking offence, but not doing so, is punishable with up to five years in prison and a fine; planning or executing a plan of trafficking into or out of Pakistan may be punished by up to seven years in prison and a fine; and if the trafficking offense includes kidnapping, abduction or attempting to kidnap or abduct, punishment may be up to 10 years in prison and a fine.^{xxx}

The Trafficking Ordinance also prohibits buying, selling, harbouring, transporting, providing, detaining, or obtaining a child or woman by coercion, kidnapping, abduction or by giving or receiving any benefit for trafficking the child or woman into or out of Pakistan, for purposes of exploitative entertainment.^{xxxi} Punishment may be up to 10 years' imprisonment and a fine, or up to 14 years' imprisonment and a fine if kidnapping or abduction took place.^{xxxii} The law further punishes: altering documents to facilitate an offence;^{xxxiii} preventing or restricting a person's liberty to move or travel;^{xxxiv} organized criminal activity in connection with trafficking,^{xxxv} and repeated violations.^{xxxvi} This statute also provides some assistance to child victims, such as medical care and shelter.^{xxxiii}

The Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance prohibits bringing or attempting to move any woman or girl between provinces for the purpose of prostitution; violators may be punished with up to three years' imprisonment, up to a Rs. 1,000 (US\$ 17) fine, and, if male, a whipping in lieu of or in addition to these punishments.^{xxxviii}

Finally, the *Hudood* Ordinance prohibits various activities related to trafficking, such as: inducing a woman to go from any place with the intent that she may, or knowing that it is likely that she will, be forced or seduced into illicit intercourse;^{xxxix} kidnapping or abducting a person so that they may, or knowing that it is likely that the person will, be subjected to the unnatural lust of another person;^{xl} buying or selling a person for purposes of prostitution or illicit intercourse;^{xlii} and, taking away, concealing, or detaining a woman with the intent that she may have illicit intercourse with any person.^{xlii}

Pakistan's laws in the area of child trafficking are far better than its laws on child prostitution, but they could be further strengthened to consistently protect all children against trafficking for sexual purposes. The Trafficking Ordinance's offence of child trafficking does not make clear that it applies in cases where children have provided consent. Its provisions are limited to trafficking into and out of the country, therefore excluding cases of internal trafficking within Pakistan.

The Prostitution Ordinance, on the other hand, appears to address cases of internal trafficking by prohibiting bringing a woman or girl into a province for purposes of prostitution, but it does not

include cases involving trafficking into and out of Pakistan, nor does it prohibit most of the activities that constitute trafficking, such as transferring, harbouring, or receiving a child for purposes of prostitution. Moreover, it is limited to girl children and offers no protection to boys. Similarly, while the *Hudood* Ordinance prohibits selling, buying, kidnapping, abducting, taking away, concealing, detaining or inducing a person for purposes of illicit intercourse, in some cases it only protects girls and women, and leaves out many other activities that constitute trafficking.

4.6 Juvenile Justice

Whereas legal provisions relating to juvenile justice do not necessarily touch upon child sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation, they are relevant not only because children may be offenders but also because children in contact with the law are vulnerable to sexual abuse (by police and prison authorities) and in need of special protection

The Pakistan Penal Code exempts a child below the age of 7 from criminal liability, and a child above 7 years but under 12 may also be exempted if it can be proved that the child was not sufficiently mature to understand the nature and consequence of his or her conduct.

The Criminal Procedure Code provides that a child below the age of 16 years may be released on bail even if charged for a non-bailable offence carrying life imprisonment or imprisonment for life. Legal standards pertaining to the juvenile justice system have been revised and improved with the adoption, in 2000, of the Juvenile Justice System Ordinance and Rules (2001), which increased the age limit of a child by defining a child as a person who has not yet turned 18 at the time of committing of an offence. If the age of the child is unknown, the Juvenile Court can call for a medical report to determine the age.

The ordinance also provides for legal assistance at the expense of the state for every accused child, and provides for special Juvenile Courts to try the child. It further provides for the rehabilitation of juvenile offenders and bans the death sentence for children below the age of 18. It protects the privacy of the accused by prohibiting the publication of photos or the name of the accused juvenile. It also introduces special measures to protect the rights of the child during police detention.¹⁵

¹⁵

Second Periodic Report of Pakistan, UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, 2001.

5. CHILD PROTECTION AND PREVENTION INITIATIVES IN PAKISTAN

Pakistan has initiated a number of protection and prevention initiatives to protect children. However, effective implementation has always been a weak area and as a result, such initiatives have done very little to protect children from commercial sexual exploitation.

5.1 Child Protection Units

Pakistan's Federal Investigation Agency has a law enforcement branch that focuses on immigration control, human trafficking and terrorism, among other crimes.^{xliii} It also has an anti-trafficking wing that enhances cooperation with law enforcement offices at regional and international levels, and with relevant government agencies and departments.^{xliv} One of its current issues is the trafficking of boys to the Middle East for use as camel jockeys.^{xlv}

5.2 Training of Law Enforcement Personnel

The Sindh Journalists Network (SJN), in association with Unicef, launched a capacity building project in Sindh province for the major stakeholders of the juvenile justice system, including the judiciary, police, prison, probation and parole officials, social welfare departments and NGO representatives. According to the SJN, several arrested child victims of sexual exploitation have been released from jail in Thatta City as a result of the workshops and jail visits.

5.3 Coordination and Cooperation

5.3.1 Local and National Level

On 20 November 2003, the Universal Child Rights Day, President General Pervez Musharraf signed a pledge to ensure all rights to Pakistani children, including protection from abuse and exploitation. The federal government also declared 2004 the Year of Child Rights and Welfare in Pakistan and a number of activities were planned to raise awareness of children's rights and issues surrounding the protection of children.

The prime minister's office has established an Inter-Ministerial Committee on Human Trafficking, Smuggling and Illegal Immigration that is charged with developing a comprehensive policy to combat trafficking. The government has also set up an inter-agency task force to combat human trafficking. The task force is charged with closing legal loopholes and improving inter-agency cooperation, and female officials have been hired to identify women and children victims of human trafficking at 18 border stations. The government has also organized several conferences to educate government officials and NGOs about trafficking.

The National Commission for Child Welfare and Development has set up a sub-group on Child

Sexual Exploitation and Abuse in the National Expert Committee on Social Welfare and Protection of Rights. It has also developed a plan of action in collaboration with the UN's Economic and Social Commission of the Asia Pacific (UNESCAP) on combating child trafficking and child sexual exploitation.⁵

5.3.2 Regional and International Level

Pakistan is one of the seven South Asian Association of Regional Cooperation (SAARC) member states. At the 11th SAARC Summit held in Katmandu in January 2002, Pakistan agreed to take effective measures to deal with the various aspects of prevention, interdiction, and suppression of trafficking in women and children. At the same forum, it also pledged to take action in relation to the repatriation and rehabilitation of victims of trafficking and prevent the use of women and children in international prostitution networks, particularly where SAARC member states are the countries of origin, transit and destination. In this regard, Pakistan has signed two conventions related to children: the SAARC Convention on Preventing and Combating the Trafficking in Women and Children for Prostitution and the SAARC Convention on Regional Arrangements for the Promotion of Child Welfare in South-Asia. It has, however, only ratified the convention on trafficking.

5.4 Prevention

5.41 Awareness Raising Initiatives

In terms of awareness-raising activities related to child sex abuse and the commercial sexual exploitation of children, the National Commission for Child Welfare and Development (NCCWD) has prepared a manual on "Psychosocial Recovery and Rehabilitation of Victims" in collaboration with core group members of the National Policy and Plan of Action against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation. Based on this manual, members of the core group organized training events for a limited number of professionals between from 2002 to 2004.

Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA) has launched a help line for women and children in Karachi called "*Madadgar*," in collaboration with Unicef, to help victims of torture, and sexual and physical abuse. The objective is to support the government and civil society in the process of implementing the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women. It reviews policy, enforcement, monitoring and evaluation procedures and hopes to raise awareness and report on progress. The strategy is to form a support service system by setting up a database on missing children through help lines, referral support services, crisis intervention services for women and children, and documentation available in Karachi.⁶

Along with LHRLA, other NGOs including Sahil, Rozan, the Pakistan Pediatric Association, Struggle for Change (SACH) and Vision are providing services to child victims of sexual abuse in Pakistan's main cities.⁷

Sahil, for instance, works with children in Islamabad, especially those who are sexually abused and sexually exploited. The organization carries out awareness-raising campaigns through regular publications, and organized two events. The first, the "Consultation on National Policy and Plan of Action to protect children from commercial sexual exploitation with the Parliamentarians" in December 2003, aimed to sensitize parliamentarians on the issue of commercial sexual exploitation and abuse in Pakistan and to draw their attention to the NPA. The second was the "National Consultation on Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation," also held in December 2003. That event aimed to present and solicit suggestions on the child sex abuse and exploitation situation to policy makers, the media, academia, and various national and international organizations, and to push the government to formulate and implement appropriate laws for the prevention, protection and rehabilitation of children in light of the CRC, which it is party to.⁸

Other civil society organisations, such as the Child Rights and Abuse Committee of the PPA – the representative body of paediatricians in Pakistan – work to promote and protect children's rights by regularly disseminating information on the reality of child sexual exploitation and the crucial role of families and society in protecting children.⁹

5.4.2 Preventive Social Services

At the level of preventive social services, Pakistani NGOs have been quite active.

LHRLA provides free legal assistance and counselling to prisoners, victims of trafficking, women prosecuted under the discriminatory *Hudood* laws and children being tried for juvenile offences.

PPA has organised consultations on the exposure of children to online pornography in provincial capital cities for Internet service providers, Internet club owners, media practitioners and government officials. "Netsmart" rules on safe Internet surfing have been distributed to schoolchildren.

Save the Children Sweden runs a juvenile justice programme that provides education, vocational skills training and counseling for young people, as well as training for police and jail staff.

SACH in Islamabad focuses on violence against women and children. Activities include rescue and recovery operations, rehabilitation and psychosocial counseling, awareness raising, and the provision of free legal aid. It operates through its Community Education Centres, which provide non-formal education to working children. SACH assisted UNESCAP n developing a manual on psychological counseling for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation, entitled "Psycosocial and medical services for sexually abuse and exploited children and youth".

6. FORMS OF PROSTITUTION OF BOYS

6.1 Sexual Exploitation and Abuse of Children in and around Bus Terminals

The prostitution of boys living on the streets of Pakistan's major cities mostly takes place at bus terminals and in public parks.

Bus terminals are the primary abode of runaways and street children, and they serve as the principal venue for boys to sell sex. Islamabad-based NGOs Struggle for Change (SACH) and Sahil have extensively studied the situation at Pir Wadhai bus terminal in the nearby city of Rawalpindi, where they found children suffering the worst forms of sexual exploitation.

Researchers for this report also uncovered some harrowing cases at the Haji Camp bus terminal in Peshawar, North West Frontier Province, where many children are subjected to physical, emotional and sexual abuse.

At a focus group discussion, children from Haji Camp identified sexual abuse and exploitation as their main problem. They told researchers that the staff and owners of nearby small hotels, inns and workshops come to the terminal for sex with boys or to pick up children for hotel guests, and that sometimes they beat the boys to force them to comply. The boys also said older children from Haji Camp and the surrounding area sometimes beat them to force them into having sex. The boys are paid Rs. 20 to Rs. 30 (US\$ 0.30 to US\$ 0.50) for each sexual encounter.

Grown men, known as *bachabaz*, frequent the Haji Camp terminal seeking the sexual services of young boys, offering money and other incentives. The researchers found that many of the boys are addicted to tobacco and hashish, so they are easy targets for men who sexually exploit them in return for money or drugs. Some men come in their cars, pick up boys and drive them away. Bus drivers at the terminal have been known to offer to give boys rides to other cities then sexually abuse them at their destination. Some truck drivers keep boys on a permanent basis for sexual services.

6.2 'Free floating' Boys in Prostitution – Hijras, Zenanas, Chawas and Malishias

The following information was gathered through focus group discussions, interviews with key informants and direct observations by field researchers. Free floating boys are the boys selling sex from place to place and not confined to a particular location,

Not all hijras, zenanas, chawas and malishias are involved in commercial sex.

6.2.1 Hijras

Also known as the third sex, *hijras* are biological males but are usually castrated. They consider themselves neither male or female, but commonly have feminine names, dress as women, wear

jewellery and cosmetics, grow their hair long, and prefer to be referred to as 'she'. Traditionally they are dancers, but some are also involved in prostitution.

Hijras usually live together in a single community and follow a specific code governing their relationships with each other and with their leader, or guru. All earnings within the community go to the guru, who looks after the *hijras*' basic needs including food, clothing, shelter and medicine. The guru also teaches them how to dance, attract and give pleasure to exploiters.

6.2.2 Zenanas

Also biological males, *zenanas* are not castrated but consider themselves women inside men's bodies. *Zenanas* may or may not feminize their behaviour in public, but commonly wear make up, women's clothes and take on the female role during sex as the penetrated partner.

6.2.3 Chawas

Chawas are usually young men who look and behave like ordinary males, and who indulge in sex with other men. They will penetrate and be penetrated, orally and anally. There are about 2,500 *Chawas* in the cruising areas of Lahore.

6.2.4 Malishias

Malishias are professional massage workers although some also sell sex to men. The name *malishia* defines an occupation rather than sexual preference or identity.

Malishias usually work from one site and clang on their oil bottles to advertise their presence. Many of them have regular exploiters who take them to local hotels or their homes for a massage or sex. Most *Malishias* maintain it is generally a clean business except that some exploiters expect them to massage all body parts until they ejaculate. They charge extra for this service, and rates are pre-negotiated.

Many boys are lured into the massage trade while living or working on the street, often between the ages of 13 years to 15 years. Sometimes an older mentor trains the boy for a number of years, but may also subject him to abuse and take his earnings. The massage business is lucrative; on average a massage worker will earn up to Rs. 500 (US\$ 8.30) from each exploiter and may service two or three exploiters a day. There are no pimps or middlemen.

Some *malishias* are drug addicts, and some suffer from contagious skin diseases or sexually transmitted infections.

6.3 Bachabazi

Under *bachabazi*, a common practice in North West Frontier Province, rich, influential adult men keep young boys for sexual services in exchange for money or other gifts. Most *bacahbaz* men seek out feminine boys with soft, light skin and hairless bodies. *Bachabazi* is tolerated but

frowned upon in the province; societal attitudes towards homosexuality make general acceptance impossible. *Bachabaz* men are usually rich and powerful and take pride in keeping boys, perceiving the practice as a symbol of power and status.

A study conducted in 1997 by the NGOs Coalition on Child Rights (NCCR) and Unicef, titled "Community perceptions of male child sexual abuse in NWFP",¹⁶ concluded that *Bachabazi* is a highly prevalent and socially tolerated practice in the province.

Some interesting comments on *bachabazi* arose during a focus group discussion in NWFP, in which one clan head suggested that strict gender segregation was responsible for this exploitative practice. Religious leaders in the same discussion group disagreed, blaming men who have drifted from Islam and are concerned only with worldly pleasures. All participants agreed that poverty and a lack of parental control and supervision encourages boys into *bachabazi* and other forms of commercial sex.

6.4 Child Prostitution in Schools

In September 2003, a newspaper report uncovered long-term sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation of children on a massive scale at a secondary school in Peshawar, sending shockwaves across Pakistan. The abuse had reportedly been going on for more than two decades and only became public after a change of school principal.

According to the report by Azhar Ali Shah in Peshawar's Daily Mashriq, the abuse began when the head of a sex mafia became a teacher at the school 25 years earlier. He and some other teachers at the school physically and emotionally abused boys then forced them to have sex with school staff. After that, they were able to threaten and blackmail the boys into the commercial sex trade. Boys who refused to comply would be heavily fined or otherwise disciplined. It gradually became an organised sex mafia that supplied boys to men in nearby hotels and inns. The mafia established contacts with influential people who protected the organisation in the community, and the group was reportedly so well connected that it was able to foil attempts by successive principals to transfer the abusers.

After the story came to light, the government ordered an official inquiry that found the allegations to be substantially correct and recommended action to be taken against the teachers and others involved. The provincial law department said a criminal case could be registered based on the evidence collected, and the provincial government ordered a police inquiry in 2004. Nevertheless, by mid-2004 no criminal charges had been brought against the exploiters. Local teachers' associations reportedly blocked any legal action saying criminal charges would demoralise and demonise the teaching community. A concerned citizen also filed a petition at Peshawar High Court.

¹⁶

NCCR-UNICEF. Community perceptions of male child sexual abuse in NWFP, Pakistan- 1997

Local newspapers and some earlier NGO studies reported instances of sexual exploitation and abuse of children in schools in North West Frontier Province.¹⁷

The Working Group on sexual exploitation and abuse of children, headed by the Pakistan Pediatric Association, is closely pursuing the case with the local authorities. The issue was also raised and generated a lot of heat at the National Consultation on child sexual abuse and exploitation, organized by PPA and Save the Children Sweden in Islamabad, 24 December 2003. Private TV channel Geo Television also covered the story and reported on the commercial sexual exploitation of children in a special broadcast.

The NWFP Education Minister told the provincial assembly on 10 March 2004 that no action had been taken against the accused persons because of a lack of solid evidence. The speaker of the assembly ordered a judicial enquiry, to be completed in one month. The report of the judicial enquiry has not yet been made public.

A common concern expressed by community leaders and adolescent boys in focus group discussions was that schools are not safe places for children. Teachers, whose role should be to protect children from abuse, can become abusers and exploiters due to poor supervision by the Education Department and the local community.

6.5 Exposure of Children to Pornography at Internet Cafés

Pakistan may not have been a frontrunner in the global Internet revolution, but according to official data the Internet had spread to more than 1,812 cities, towns and villages nationwide in 2004,¹⁸ up from 350 centres two years earlier. Although the benefits of great Internet connectivity are manifold, it brings with it the problem of improved access to online pornography including images of children.

Information on the extent and nature of child pornography in South Asia is very limited, but the growing availability of the Internet through specialised cafés across Pakistan means that children and adults have increasing access to child pornography on the web.

In Pakistan, Internet cafés are generally located in busy markets and shopping plazas, but some are located in semi-residential areas. A typical Internet café is small, usually housing between 10 to 20 computers with each workstation usually enclosed in a wooden or cardboard cubicle to afford the web-surfer some privacy. A casual visitor will normally have no idea what other users are doing. Some cafés even have cabins that are fully enclosed with a door that can be locked from the inside. Doors to these establishments often have tinted or coloured glass so it is difficult to see in from the outside. The cafés often provide facilities for chatting online including headphones, and video streaming. Users can bring movie CD-ROMs, DVDs or VCDs to watch.

¹⁷ NCCR-UNICEF. Child abuse and crimes against children in NWFP- 1997.

¹⁸ Pakistan Economic Survey 2003-4, Government of Pakistan, June 2004.

A study conducted in 2004 by the Pakistan Pediatric Association (PPA) and Save the Children Sweden, produced some worrying conclusions. Almost 50 percent of the 56 children interviewed admitted they had visited a pornographic website and over 80 percent could name a pornographic website. Some said they go online to chat, but most download pictures or movies.¹⁹

Boys in this study came from two distinct social groups; young men who work at small hotels and workshops and pool their money to download pictures and movies, and lower-middle class youths who go with their friends to look at pictures but who often have computer access – but no privacy – at home. The latter group also commonly pooled their funds.

Many of the boys told the interviewers that they were interested in getting pictures of Indian or Hollywood stars in the nude. They said they look at the pictures for fun and usually share their experiences with classmates and other friends. The owners of some cafés said some boys watch sex movies from CD-ROMs.

The Pakistan Telecommunication Authority has framed a code of conduct for Internet café owners, effectively barring them from allowing children below 12 years of age into their establishments. They must also keep a close eye on young Internet users to ensure they are not logging on to pornographic sites. The authority has blocked access to more than 10,000 pornographic websites and issued public warnings to some café owners.

In 2003, the PPA and Save the Children Sweden conducted a number of seminars and consultative meetings with Internet café owners, Internet service providers, parents, teachers, media and children to address the issue. All participants agreed that the government and Internet service providers should strictly control pornography on the Internet. Another suggestion was to abolish the cabin system at the Internet cafés and station the computers in open areas.

The PPA has also developed and disseminated "Netsmart" rules on safe Internet usage by children.

Another related issue is the clandestine growth of mini-cinema houses in small and major towns across Pakistan that screen X-rated movies and are frequented by children and adults. These establishments have been linked to cases of child sex abuse and exploitation.

¹⁹

Exposure of Children to Pornography at the Internet cafés of Pakistan PPA-SC Sweden, 2001.

7. PROFILES OF BOY VICTIMS OF SEXUAL EXPLOITATION

7.1 Boy victims of commercial sexual exploitation

There are some important similarities between boy victims of prostitution in different circumstances and places.

7.1.1 Socio-economic Background:

The overwhelming majority of boys involved in prostitution come from poor families in rural and semi-urban areas. Many of the boys interviewed for this study said their fathers had died or were unemployed or under-employed. NGOs have found that economic stagnation and rising unemployment rates force families to put their children into work; often the places where children are most likely to find jobs are where they will also be exposed to the risk of sexual exploitation.

When the mass abuse and murder of more than 100 boys in Lahore by Javaid Iqbal was uncovered in December 1999, it was also revealed that most of his victims had come from low income families Their parents were not so much concerned about where their children were working but more that they were bringing home money.²⁰

During focus group discussions in Peshawar, North West Frontier Province, community leaders and parents said that children receive less parental supervision and emotional support than previous generations. This has led to a marked increase in the number of children involved in substance abuse, prostitution, theft, smuggling and other criminal activities. They noted that families are no longer as strong as they once were because of poverty, and blamed a lack of economic and social infrastructure.

"Parents give less to their children because they possess less", one community leader remarked.

7.1.2 Domestic Abuse and Neglect

Most of the runaways and boy victims of prostitution who took part in focus group discussions and in-depth interviews for this study revealed they had suffered physical and emotional abuse and neglect at home.

Some parents were unable to cope with the demands of parenthood and society, and could not provide for the basic needs of their families. Others became physically and emotionally abusive because they couldn't deal with stress.

Neglect of a child is the failure to provide for his basic needs including food, health, education, emotional development and safe shelter. Neglecting a child can jeopardize his health as well as his physical, mental, spiritual, moral and social development.

²⁰

[,] Confronting Reality, the Mass Murderer of Lahore, PPA-SC Sweden, 2000.

ECPAT estimates that approximately 80 percent of the children exploited in the commercial sex industry in Pakistan previously suffered physical or emotional abuse within their families.²¹ Runaway boys who participated in focus group discussions in Lahore and Peshawar supported that estimate overwhelmingly, citing abusive home environments as their primary reason for leaving home. Six of the 16 boys in the Peshawar discussion said they dropped out of school because of corporal punishment and other humiliating treatment at school.

7.1.3 Age of Victims

Most of the boys involved in this study appeared to be in their mid- to late-teens; ascertaining their exact ages was impossible because of a lack of identity documents.

7.1.4 Educational Status

Almost all the boys who participated in interviews and focus group discussions for this study were either illiterate or had dropped out of school at an early age. The discussions revealed that illiteracy, coupled with poverty and an abusive home and school environment are important factors behind the commercial sexual exploitation of children in Pakistan.

A 2004 report by the State Bank of Pakistan paints a dismal picture of primary education in the country.²² The report says 5.8 million children out of 22.33 million in the 5-9 year age range do not go to school. It says 15 percent of government schools have no buildings, 52 percent have no boundary walls and 71 percent are without electricity. Teacher absenteeism is rampant, particularly in rural areas, thanks to poor surveillance, weak administration and political influences. Such a state of affairs lead to a high drop out rate and is responsible for a large number of boys engaged in child labour and highly vulnerable to abuse and exploitation.

7.1.5 Refugees

Since 1978, more than 4.5 million Afghans have fled their homeland to escape decades of civil conflict and factional fighting, taking refuge in Pakistan, Iran and other neighbouring countries. The refugees left behind extended families, friends and their familiar, traditional way of life. They have only limited access to health care, education and other social services in Pakistan.

Afghan participants at a focus group discussion in Peshawar, said the commercial sexual exploitation of children is more pervasive among refugees than is officially recognized. They said poverty in the Afghan refugee community has led to an increase in child labour and in the number of children forced into prostitution. According to adolescent boys in the focus group, Afghan and Pakistani men often sexually exploit Afghan boys who live on the streets.

²¹ ECPAT International website: www.ecpat.net

²² Second Quarterly Report, State Bank of Pakistan, March 30, 2004

7.1.6 Working Children

Child labour is a reality of life in Pakistan. According to a survey conducted by Pakistan's Federal Bureau of Statistics and the International Labour Organization, there were 3.6 million child laborers in Pakistan in 1996,²³ but many people working on the issue believe the actual number is much higher.

Interviews and focus group discussions revealed that these children, especially those who work at bus terminals and small roadside hotels and restaurants, are particularly vulnerable to sexual abuse and exploitation.

7.2 Sex Exploiters of Boys

Child sex tourism has never been reported from Pakistan where the exploiters are usually men who live locally. Not enough information is available to construct a comprehensive profile of local sex exploiters.

Bazabach men in the North West Frontier Province come from all age ranges, but tend to be fairly wealthy, influential and often married.

Research conducted for this study shows that adult workers from rural areas who travel to the city for employment (Lahore and Peshawar) sometimes seek boys for sex. Truck and bus drivers sometimes trick boys into compromising positions by promising to take them on as apprentices. Men who stay in the small hotels and inns near bus terminals sometimes seek the sexual services of boys in the vicinity, as do the hotel owners and staff. Sometimes young, educated men or college students seek boys for sex.

A Study of Child Labour in Pakistan, Ministry of Labour & Manpower and Federal Bureau of Statistics,
 1996

8. INTERVIEW FINDINGS

8.1 Boys at Risk of Commercial Sexual Exploitation

8.1.1 Street Children

Sixteen boys aged 13-17 years participated in a focus group discussion at a village near <u>Peshawar in North West Frontier Province. Four of them were employed at automobile</u> <u>workshops, four were students at a local school, five lived on the street and three came from</u> <u>a local child labour rehabilitation centre.</u>

Discussions were structured so as to create an enabling environment that made the boys feel safe and comfortable enough to share their opinions and experiences. They were invited to draw and write down their responses on small cards, flip charts and posters. Assistance was given to illiterate boys to maximize their participation.

Initially the boys were reluctant to express their views regarding child sexual abuse and exploitation, but gradually opened up as the discussion progressed. They said they were uncomfortable using any words associated with sex and sexuality.

None of the participants had a clear opinion on what constitutes a child. All of them, except for three of the schoolchildren, felt that a child becomes an adult at the age of 14; the students said adulthood begins at 16 years, when a child leaves secondary school and enters a college or starts to look for a job.

Three of the students and the three from the rehabilitation centre agreed that children and adults have the same rights. Almost all of the boys said their parents never consulted them on any household matter including decisions affecting their lives.

The participants also complained about corporal punishment and other humiliating treatment at school, including insults and abuse from teachers in front of classmates. Three of the street *boys* and the three from the rehabilitation centre said they dropped out of school because of corporal punishment. Seven of the boys insisted that most school dropouts head to the city to look for work even though they have nowhere to live and no protection.

The street boys said that men had picked up some of their friends and sexually exploited them, and that schoolchildren often sell sex to meet their personal expenses. Two of the students agreed.

They named videogame arcades and snooker clubs as pick-up places. One of the street boys said that "bad men" frequent the arcades; when the boys run out of money, the "bad men" offer them coins so they can carry on playing. Thus the boys at the arcades are forced, tricked or manipulated into sex.

The street boys strongly argued that the decision to move into prostitution is not a conscious one. They said people use love, violence, blackmail, threats and false promises of a better future to trap or lure boys into prostitution. The schoolchildren disagreed. They said if such boys listened to their parents they would not fall into bad company and expose themselves to the risk of sexual abuse and exploitation.

The boys unanimously agreed that although parents value their sons, they are more concerned about protecting daughters.

8.1.2 Runaways

a) Boys at the Nigheban temporary shelter in Lahore.

Fifteen runaway boys aged from 11 years to 16 years took part in a focus group discussion. They were staying at a *Nigheban* centre in Lahore, a temporary shelter run by Punjab province's Department of Social Welfare.

Some of the boys said they had been forced to sell sex at sleazy hotels, small tea-stalls, auto shops and bus terminals, and that they felt they couldn't escape the sexual exploitation. They said hotel owners gave them food and a place to stay if they worked at their establishments, and that sometimes they were forced to have sex with the hoteliers. Some said they were forced to have sex with other people in exchange for money, most of which was kept by their employers. The boys were sometimes given Rs. 10 to Rs. 20 (U\$ 0.15 to US\$ 0.30).

The younger boys who had been forced into prostitution said they weep and muffle their screams after each sexual encounter. They said they feel isolated and abandoned, they hate themselves, pity their condition, and need affection.

Eight *Nigehban* centres in Punjab provide temporary shelter for lost, runaway and kidnapped boys. The centres provide free food and accommodation, and the children stay there until they can be returned to their families.

b) Boys at Minar-e-Pakistan in Lahore

Five runaway boys aged from 10-15 years participated in walk-through interviews at *Minar-e-Pakistan*, the national monument in Karim Park, Lahore.

The monument is a known hangout and hub for runaways; many disembark from route wagons at nearby Lorry Adda and head for the park. Free food is handed out at the *Data Darbar* shrine and there are plenty of opportunities to make and spend money in the area – in particular at cinemas, videogame arcades and snooker clubs.

Minar-e-Pakistan is also where the notorious pedophile and mass murderer Javed Iqbal picked up the more than 100 children who he abused and killed in the 1990s. He said: "So what if I killed 100 children ... I can find an even greater number of runaway and abused children at any given time near the Minar-e-Pakistan".

Almost all the boys interviewed left home because they were subjected to severe physical and emotional abuse. Some of them had been sexually abused.

Three out of five admitted to their involvement in commercial sex and saw it as a means of survival. They indicated that their main exploiters were workers from local hotels, tea stalls, auto shops, and the bus station.

Reports by *Idara-e-Khidmat-e-Khalaq-Pakistan*, the NGO responsible for the repatriation of lost children found in the area, suggest that most of the boys at Karim Park are aged 11-16 years, and come from the neighboring districts of Gujranwala, Sheikhupura, Muridke and Kasur. Some came from as far as Southern Punjab, including the cities of Multan and Lodhran. Most boys rode for six to eight hours on public transport to reach Lahore. According to the organisation's data, 10 to 12 children are reunited with their families on average every day, although that figure goes up to about 20 around the time of local fairs, festivals and holidays.

The provincial government entrusts *Idara-e-Khidmat-e-Khalaq-Pakistan* with this responsibility to supplement services for runaways provided by the *Nigheban* temporary shelters, which are considered inadequate to deal with the massive number of boys arriving in Lahore every day. Lahore has only one *Nigheban* centre, run by the province's Department of Social Welfare, with the capacity to house up to 30 children at a time. It suffers from a lack of funds and skilled workers.

In comparison, *Idara-e-Khidmat-e-Khalaq-Pakistan* generates its own funds and operates independent of bureaucratic hurdles. The NGO carries out services that would ideally be undertaken by the *Nigehban* centres.

According to the boys interviewed, the centre's presence is limited to an unmanned kiosk near Lorry Adda that an official visits twice a week. *Idara-e-Khidmat-e-Khalaq-Pakistan* collects homeless children from the area surrounding *Minar-e-Pakistan* and gives them shelter and food. Volunteers from the NGO then return the children to their families whom they bill for lodging and travel costs. These normally run into thousands of rupees.

The assistant director of the Child Rights Cell at the Department of Social Welfare, Women Development, and *Bait-ul-Mal* (Punjab) claims this is tantamount to selling the children back to their parents. He says the cost is Rs. 5,000 (US\$ 83). The NGO denies this allegation and says it asks for the actual expenditure, and only from those who can afford to pay.

Officials from Idara-e-Khidmat-e-Khalaq-Pakistan say some of the boys are not very keen to return to the circumstances that made them leave home in the first place, but that when they are threatened with police action, they comply and are willing to go home.

Excerpts of interviews with two of the runaways at *Minar-e-Pakistan* are given below.

Note: Names of the respondents have been changed to protect their identities:

"I come from a very poor and large family in Sheikhupura near Lahore. I am the eldest of five children. My father is a mason but can hardly find any work. I have to earn money for my family at any cost. I am ready to do anything for money, even selling myself for sexual services. If you (the researcher) want to hire me I am ready to go anywhere. I can provide both boys and girls for sex. I have to work and have no free time". (Safur, 16, Lahore)

"I come from a poor family in Azad Kashmir. I am the second of six children. My father is a mason but his income is insufficient to meet our needs. I left school due to severe beatings and humiliating treatment by my teachers. I had nothing to do at home and my father would beat me every day. I ran away from home and ended up in Lahore. The bus driver who brought me to Lahore sexually abused me. I came to Data Darbar and started living with a man who would regularly have sex with me. He always used a condom whenever he had sex with me. I also sell sex to other people and most of then don't use condoms. I am sick of my life but have no way to escape." (Shazid, 14, Lahore)

8.1.3 Children from Large and Dysfunctional Families

The gruesome murder of more than 100 children in Lahore by Javed Iqbal, revealed several factors behind the sexual abuse and exploitation of street children in major Pakistani cities. The Pakistan Pediatric Association built up case studies of five of the victims,²⁴ from which some common features emerged.

All five came from large low-income families. Their fathers worked as daily wage laborers. Family members said the father behaved harshly towards his son and that no one in the family was taken care of adequately. All five boys were forced into child labor, and their families were partly dependent on their income. Most of the family members interviewed were more concerned about the loss of extra income than the safety of the victims. Almost all family members said that normally they were not too concerned about what the boy was doing to earn money, or where. For them it was enough that they were working somewhere and contributing to the family income.

Brief extracts from some of the case studies are given below. *Note: Names of the respondents have been changed to protect their identities:*

"I come from Buner (a poor district in North West Frontier Province). There are seven people in my family. My father is a mason and can hardly earn Rs. 120 (US\$ 2) a day, if he finds work. He is a drug addict and beats everybody at home, including my mother. None of us have ever been to school. I ran away from home about two years ago and landed up at Haji Camp bus terminal (in Peshawar). I work and live at a small hotel near the bus terminal. The owner of the hotel is sexually abusing me. Sometimes, I also have sex with other people. I don't know how much my

²⁴

Confronting Reality - Sexual Exploitation and Abuse of Children in Pakistan, PPA-SC Sweden, 2000

exploiters are charged by the owners. My income varies, but I am usually given Rs. 20 to Rs. 30 (US\$ 0.33 to US\$ 0.50) each time". (JK, 16, Peshawar)

"My family consists of 12 persons. My father is a drug addict. Presently he is very sick and confined to bed. As I am the member of a huge family living with an insufficient income, my father told me to generate money through any means, even if I had to steal or beg. My father handed me over to a driver. I do small errands for my driver and he also has sex with me. I am extremely upset with what I am doing, but what else can a 12-year-old boy do to earn money?" (Chotoo, 12, Lahore)

8.1.4 Children Who Work at Bus Terminals and in the Transport Industry

Most boys who run away or live on the streets in Pakistan at some point end up sleeping at a bus terminal. But the terminals play a more ominous role in most runaways' lives because they are well known as venues where boys can sell sex for money.

Haji Camp is the biggest and busiest bus terminal in North West Frontier Province (NWFP). Situated on the eastern outskirts of Peshawar, the terminal is surrounded by dozens of hotels, restaurants and auto-workshops. A large number of runaway boys work at the terminal and in the establishments nearby.

Researchers for this study conducted a walk-through survey of *Haji Camp*, using observatory techniques, informal interviews and a focus group discussion. Two trained animators stayed at the terminal for three days and nights collecting evidence and observing the commercial sexual exploitation of children. Eight boys participated in the focus group discussion.

The results of the survey showed that boys at *Haji Camp*, mostly aged 10-16 years, are subjected to physical, emotional and sexual abuse. Most of them are runaways from poor families in the rural northern districts of NWFP. A majority of boys came from families with five or more children. All of them were school dropouts and complained of physical and emotional abuse at home and school. *Haji Camp* was the point at which they arrived in the city and they preferred to stay there because of the many work opportunities.

Most of the boys have no proper place to live and spend their nights in the small hotels and workshops around the terminal. All of them said they had suffered sexual abuse before entering into commercial sex.

Sexual abuse and sexual exploitation were the main problems identified by the boys. They said they were sexually abused and exploited by the employees of the terminal and the staff and owners of small hotels, inns and workshops in the area. Some said older boys at the terminal and from surrounding neighbourhoods forced them to have sex by beating them. The older boys also stole money from the younger boys who said they had no way of protecting themselves.

Bachabaz men frequently visit *Haji Camp* to lure young boys into having sex with them, using promises of money or other tricks. They usually approach boys through pimps, but sometimes dealt with the boys directly or through other boys. They are mostly rich men from Peshawar city and adjacent areas, but sometimes also from elsewhere in the province. Many are frequent visitors to *Haji Camp* and are well known to boys and other men at the terminal. Some of them

come in their own cars, pick up boys and ride away. Some of the boys involved in *bachabazi* are addicted to hashish, so the men offer them drugs in return for sex.

The coach drivers sometimes take boys for ride to other cities where they abuse them. Both boys and key informants said many long distance truck drivers keep boys for sexual services on a permanent basis. The animators endorsed this information. These boys are kept under the guise of helpers or apprentices and accompany the drivers on all trips.

Some of the boys said the owners of inns and hotels severely beat boys and force them to have sex with men. While the exploiter may be charged Rs. 100 to Rs. 200 (US\$ 17 to US \$34), the boys receive only Rs. 20 to Rs. 30 (US\$ 0.33 to US\$ 0.50) for each sexual encounter. The men are usually bus passengers and visitors from other parts of the province or country.

Key informants also said police are well aware of what is going on at the terminal and adjacent establishments but turn a blind eye.

The researchers concluded that commercial sexual exploitation of boys is highly prevalent at the bus terminal and in other areas of the transport industry.

Interviews with boys at the Lorry Adda bus terminal in Lahore produced almost identical findings, although they didn't complain of exploiters coming in from the surrounding communities.

Extracts from some case studies follow.

Note: Names of the respondents have been changed to protect their identities:

"I come from a village near Lahore. Our family consists of 12 persons. My father is dead and we are living from hand to mouth. I am the eldest of my siblings. I am working at Lorry Adda in Lahore with a bus driver. I clean the bus and do other errands for my driver. I was reluctant to have sex with him but he told me that I must if I am interested in learning to drive. I gave in and now he has sex with me almost every day. He gives me food and money and is also training me to become a driver. I live with him near the bus stand. I visit my family once a month and give them my savings." (Abdullah, 16, Lahore)

"I am from Sialkot and there are nine children in my family. I dropped out of primary school. My father is a drug addict and he is very abusive to all of us. He left me at Lorry Adda in Lahore so that I can earn some money. I work with a driver, along with two other boys. I clean the bus and do other errands. My driver is a very cruel man. When he gets angry, he beats me black and blue. He usually uses very foul language. When he is in a good mood, he has sex with me. He gives me free food and also some money. When I get sick, he buys medicine for me. I always weep whenever I am alone." (Saheed 13, Lorry Adda, Lahore)

8.1.5 Massage Boys (Malishias)

The massage workers or *malishias* are usually young men and boys in their mid and late teens. A focus group discussion was carried out with seven massage workers aged 17-25 years, at an MSM (men who have sex with men) drop-in centre in Karim Park, Lahore. The center is run by

VISION for NAZ International, and its director, Mr. Tahir Khilji, invited the *malishias* to take part in the discussion.

The massage boys do not belong to any particular establishment but work independently or with a single *ustad* (teacher). Usually runaway boys want to learn a marketable skill so they come to these professionals or are tricked into staying on and learning the darker secrets of the trade. They are expected to massage all body parts and ejaculate the exploiter, but charge extra for this service. Boys are usually 13-15 years old when they are inducted into massage work.

While the child is in training, usually a period of three to four years, the teacher collects all the money he earns. If a boy develops *zenana* or *chawa* (feminine) characteristics, he does not stay with the *ustad* but finds a "*pakka dost*" (best friend) to live with.

Most of the massage workers said they camp out in a dark corner and provide services for Rs. 50 to Rs. 100 (US\$ 9 to US\$ 17) to anyone who seeks them out. Often exploiters know of them through word of mouth. If an exploiter asks them to accompany them to their home, they charge double the amount.

Researchers encountered some difficulties with this group. There was considerable resistance from adult male prostitutes who were not keen for boys to be interviewed seperately. Also, the experiences of the massage workers were quite varied, therefore making it difficult to extract generalizations, especially as concerns the differing sexual preferences of the interviewees. For example, one of the workers had a wife and two children and led a normal life, but did not tell his family what he did for a living. Another said he was openly homosexual but had been abandoned by his male partner and did not have a support system to return to.

8.1.6 Boys with Alternative Sexual Identities (Zenanas and Chawas)

Ten people aged 17-22 years involved in the commercial sex trade for homosexuals participated in a focus group discussion at the MSM (men who have sex with men) drop-in centre at Karim Park, Lahore, run by Vision for NAZ International.

The participants said they did not belong to any network or local mafia, and that they regularly met at the MSM centre to chat and get medical treatment. They said most boys are forced into prostitution when they are 13-15 years old.

Homosexuality encompasses a broad spectrum of shades and nuances in South Asia. This study corroborates an increasing volume of evidence about the different contexts under which cultural norms and societal taboos dictate the sexuality of an individual in Pakistan. With regard to the prostitution of boys, there seem to be a range of masculinities and gender identity issues with differing sexual behaviors, partner choices, perceived sexual needs, and desires regarding both exploiters and exploited boys.

Zenanas are biologically male, sometimes castrated, but prefer for all intents and purposes to present themselves in a feminine way; they dress like women and refer to themselves in the feminine form. *Chawas* continue to dress and act as men but prefer sex with other men. Those who have penetrative sex with *zenanas* or *chawas* are known as *giryas*. Social stigma surrounds the construct of penetrative sex because it feminizes at least one of the men involved.

The gender politics of the MSM context is complicated and has many connotations. In Lahore, there are men who have developed a homosexual orientation and identity within the confines of Pakistani culture and social practices. They may live with a male partner, but the couple will often refer to themselves merely as friends sharing a common residence.

The *zenanas* quoted rivalry among their ranks as a major problem, after police harassment. This infighting is reportedly universal and is mainly blamed on insecurity and low self-esteem. Therefore, the relationships are often tense, self-stigmatizing, and sometimes abusive.

The *zenanas* said they seek out their exploiters by dressing up as women and that they are clearly available for sexual services. The *chawas* are subtler because they don't dress like women, but they will make advances on anyone who they believe to be homosexual, even passersby in the street. The cost of their services varies but mostly range from Rs. 100 to Rs. 500 (US\$ 1.70 to US\$ 8.30) for each sexual encounter if no pimps are involved.

8.2 Communities

8.2.1 Focus Group Discussion with Community Leaders in North West Frontier Province The focus group discussion with community leaders was conducted in Swabi, some 100 kilometres from the provincial capital, Peshawar. Four village councillors, three religious leaders and seven clan heads participated in the discussion.

The community leaders unanimously agreed that commercial sexual exploitation of boys exists in their area and is far more pervasive than most people realise. They said worsening economic conditions have resulted in high unemployment. An important consequence of this economic deterioration and adult unemployment has been the increasing prevalence of child labor and a rise in the number of prostituted boys.

The religious leaders strongly felt that falling moral standards and increasing obscenity are also important factors behind boy prostitution. All participants supported the existing practice of sex segregation and strict control over girls and women to protect them from sexual abuse and exploitation.

They also felt that working and street boys are particularly vulnerable to all forms of exploitation and often get trapped into prostitution. One of the councillors opined that Afghan refugee boys were even more vulnerable to sexual exploitation than local boys, because most of them had very little parental supervision and control. The others unanimously endorsed his view. The leaders felt that boys who are being sexually exploited are also at a higher risk of getting involved in drugs and other crimes.

All participants admitted that they were aware of men in their community who keep young boys for sexual services, an age-old practice known as *bachabazi*. Although it is considered bad and shameful, communities generally tolerate *bachabazi*. One clan head suggested that strict gender segregation is responsible for this practice. The religious leaders did not agree and said those who

indulge in *bachabazi* are only after worldly pleasures and have drifted away from Islam. *Bachabaz* men are comparatively rich and powerful people. They take pride in keeping boys for sexual services and consider the practice a symbol of power and status. They are not bothered about *qiyamat* (judgment day) when Muslims believe God will punish them for all their sins and misdeeds. All participants agreed that lack of parental control and supervision is also an important reason for boys falling into *bachabazi*.

Three of the councillors and two clan heads said they believed that prostituted boys are themselves responsible for their situation, that such boys are usually disobedient and delinquent youngsters who refuse to listen to their parents and elders. The other nine did not agree and put the responsibility squarely on the parents and society at large.

8.2.2 Interviews with Service Providers at a Drop-in Centre for MSM, near Karim Park, Minar-e-Pakistan

The MSM (men who have sex with men) drop-in centre at Karim Park in Lahore is run by Vision and supported by NAZ International (an organization by MSM for MSM). The drop-in centre is open three days a week and provides support for boys involved in prostitution. It is a place where they can come to voice their concerns and acquire training, awareness and medical help.

Awareness of safe sex has increased condom usage and some 70 percent of boys involved in prostitution say they use condoms. The doctor on duty at the centre said the most common physical ailments he treats at the centre are body aches, tiredness, skin diseases, sexually transmitted infections, HIV/AIDS, other contagious diseases, inter-trigo, constipation, genital itching, ulceration in genital areas, peri-anal tears, scabies and Hepatitis B. Some men also seek services for symptoms related to substance abuse including hashish and glue.

The centre's director, Mr. Tahir Khilji, said that the most common problem of prostituted boys who visit the centre is harassment by the police. He said sometimes they even suffer sexual exploitation at police stations. Police often extort their money and humiliate them, but no one ever dares register complaints against the police. He said Vision is unable to do much to prevent police harassment of the boy victims of prostitution and that *zenanas* and *chawas* – the main victims – usually pay bribes to secure their release.

8.3 Police and Other State Child Protection Services

Child protection services in Pakistan are extremely weak and of poor quality. Police have access to child sexual abuse data and all incidents are recorded. Police also register reports of lost and kidnapped children. Very few police records for the commercial sexual exploitation of children exist.

The Social Welfare Department offers some basic services through *Nigehban* centres in Punjab province. As mentioned before, the *Nigheban* temporary shelters, established by the government to house lost, runaway and kidnapped children, are not well known about and under-funded. In Lahore, the shelter is located a 20 minute drive away from the city centre where the majority of

runaway children can be found. There is a *Nigheban* kiosk in that area, and the centre provides a help-line for anyone who needs to report a missing child. The centre provides boys with food and shelter, while runaway girls are referred to a separate state-run female shelter.

An independent state-run Child Protection and Welfare Bureau is working for the last one year in Punjab with the responsibility to strengthen and coordinate all child protection services in the province.

8.4 Local Sex Exploiters

All the sex exploiters whom researchers interviewed for this study were local men from diverse socio-economic backgrounds. The researchers found it extremely difficult to extract detailed information from them. A few volunteered some information on the condition of anonymity. In the following extracts, all names have been changed in accordance with that wish.

"Driving a truck over long distances is a tough job. Sometimes, we drive for 16 to 20 hours without a break .We are away from our homes for long periods .We get tired and frustrated. We are also human beings and need some rest and relaxation. We keep young boys to serve us. We give them food, money and other facilities and they don't mind having sex with us. It is all a matter of give and take". (Naved, 38, truck driver, Peshawar)

Driving on highways is a tough job. We get bored and tired. I take charas (hashish) to regain energy. Occasionally I consume alcohol. I have sex with my boy helper. I am training him to become a driver. Sex is part of the relationship. My ustad (driver/mentor) used to have sex with me and that's how I learned to drive. I am married but go home only once every two to three months. I have never used condoms and why should I - do boys get pregnant?" (Zakir, 32, bus driver, Lahore)

I am a 25-year-old single man from a village in Swat. I work at a workshop and my daily income exceeds Rs. 200 (US\$ 3.30). I live in shared accommodation, near my place of work. I have nothing to do in the evening except watch TV or see a movie. Once or twice a week, I get a boy from near the cinema halls. It may cost me from Rs. 50 to Rs. 100 (US\$ 0.83 to US\$ 1.66) per sexual encounter. I have no regrets – that is the only fun in my rough and tough life". (SM, 25, Peshawar)

9. RECOMMENDATIONS

The sexual exploitation and abuse of children are complex and under-researched issues in Pakistan requiring innovative and integrated responses. The issues of the commercial sexual exploitation of children in general and the prostitution of boys in particular need to be addressed in a holistic and child-centred manner. To be child-centred, a programme must fully respect all elements of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. This means it must recognise the rights of children and address the root causes of the sexual exploitation and abuse of boys, including patriarchal power structures, the imbalance of power between adults and children, and socio-cultural norms and practices.

9.1 Immediate Action

9.1.1 NGOs

- It is critical that the capacities of service-providing NGOs are developed to protect the rights of children. Caregivers need to have appropriate skills and knowledge of the kind of support they can offer and when to seek outside help;
- Free legal support must be provided for boys who have been sexually abused or exploited. NGOs must focus on this important issue and develop legal support services. The Karachi-based Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA) already provides legal services to child victims of abuse and trafficking;
- Refer to the experiences of boys and youths who have suffered sexual exploitation when developing intervention programmes.

9.1.2 The Government and its Agencies

- Provide protection for child witnesses standing legal trial, and introduce child-friendly procedures into the judicial system;
- Organizations providing direct services, such as *Nigehban*, need to be strengthened. The staff of such organizations should be trained to provide child-centred and child-friendly psychosocial support to boy victims of prostitution;
- Provide training to professionals, including doctors, counsellors, law enforcement officers and social workers so they can recognise signs of sexual exploitation and abuse and sensitively intervene;
- Organisational efforts to respond to the prostitution of boys need to be more systematic, integrated and programme-based. The latter requires the formulation of standard operating procedures and coordinated plans of action toward effective management and implementation of programmes to protect boys from prostitution;
- Provide accessible resources where sexually exploited boys and youths can find assistance and support;
- There is a need for more shelters and safe houses for boy victims of and those vulnerable to sexual abuse and exploitation, as well as improvements to existing facilities. These include day/night-time shelters or drop-in centres for street boys, where they can take a bath, rest, receive or be referred to psychosocial and legal support services and learn about child rights and life skills. Also included are safe homes for boy victims of

prostitution and trafficking, where boys receive protection, education, counseling, and livelihood training to optimise their chances of reintegration;

- Develop and strengthen intervention programmes focused not only on child victims but also on the family, such as reuniting and reconciliation programmes and family counselling;
- Abuse of drugs and other addictive substances is widespread among boy victims and boys vulnerable to sexual exploitation, which damages their health, exacerbates their exploitation, and makes it more difficult for them to leave the exploitative environment. Initiate specific activities, such as public awareness campaigns and targeted education/information campaigns for boys, through peer education and the strengthening of services and reintegration for addicted boys.

9.1.3 Law Enforcement.

- The mechanism for reporting sexual abuse and exploitation should be easily available to boy victims. An Ombudsperson for Children should be appointed, who can take *suo moto* action to safeguard children's rights and protect them from abuse and exploitation;
- Impose severe penalties on all who profit from the sexual exploitation of boys so that exploitation is no longer profitable;
- Strengthen awareness of child protection laws at all levels;
- Develop a good referral system between hospitals, police and shelter homes for boys.

9.2 Long Term Actions

9.2.1 NGOs

- Implement education programmes for boys at risk so they can recognize potential sexual exploitation and be aware of appropriate ways to protect and empower themselves;
- Educate the community so it can recognize boys who may be at risk of sexual exploitation, recognize exploiters and their tricks, and be aware of strategies and actions for intervention;
- Sensitize boys and adolescents on the issue of commercial sexual exploitation of boys, while making headway with the integration of child rights into the school curriculum. Children's clubs and child-centred media may be important tools for sensitizing boys. Peer-support programmes and peer-to-peer drama may be interesting and useful methods to strengthen child participation and ownership of children's rights;
- The capabilities of community members in prevention activities need to be strengthened by conducting awareness on the issue of prostitution of boys, monitoring the situation, and detecting and reporting cases of prostitution. Communities should be involved in the reintegration process of the victims from the beginning. This may avoid stigmatization and facilitate reintegration of the victim;
- There is a lack of reliable quantitative data on the commercial sexual exploitation of boys in Pakistan. An in-depth nationwide situation analysis is needed. The analysis may also look into data gathering regarding profiles of the perpetrators of child sexual abuse and exploitation, including traffickers and pornographers. The conclusions should be used for advocacy, lobbying and designing child protection programming;

• There is a lack of high quality research on gender relations, masculinity and sexuality. Better data on these issues would assist in understanding the taboos and barriers to be addressed and facilitate the development of gender-sensitive and culturally appropriate psychosocial support mechanisms.

9.2.2 The Government and its Agencies

- Root causes that add to the vulnerability of boys need to be addressed through awareness and social mobilization programmes. Examples of issues that need attention are livelihood opportunities in rural and other deprived areas for adolescent boys. The current lack of options increases the vulnerability of boys to sexual abuse, exploitation and trafficking. Livelihood skills and vocational training with links to job opportunities, should be developed for adolescents;
- Personal health and protection, gender and child sexual exploitation and abuse issues should be included in the formal school curriculum. Life-skills training packages for non-formal school settings should be developed to strengthen the ability of boys to protect themselves from abusive behavior and promote their interpersonal communication skills, critical thinking, confidence and self-esteem. Such programmes will heighten their awareness and lessen the risk of them becoming victims of commercial sex;
- Awareness and education of life skills, including negotiation and assertion skills, sex education and gender roles will help in the prevention of abuse and exploitation and the development of protective behavior in boys;
- The revised National Plan of Action (NPA) should have a strengthened focus on the empowerment of adolescents, in and out of school and at the workplace, to help them to protect themselves from sexual abuse and exploitation. Activities may be initiated that aim at re-channeling the energies of boys and youth (particularly outside school) to productive endeavors such as sports and recreation, alternative modes of education, value clarification and livelihood skill development;
- A national consultation with boys and young people should be organized to receive their suggestions and feedback on the NPA. Child participation should be included in the document as a separate chapter. Specific activities should be suggested on the engagement of boys in implementing the NPA, such as the promotion of peer education and the establishment of a national monitoring mechanism for children on NPA implementation;
- There is a large population of refugees and migrants living in certain parts of the country. Specific attention needs to be given in the NPA to the inclusion of refugee and migrant boys, as well as during the development of the NPA and its implementation;
- Educate and use media to eliminate the stereotypes surrounding sexually exploited boys and youths;
- The National Commission for Child Welfare and Development and Working Group on Child Sexual Exploitation and Abuse should document successful 'best practices' to encourage others to be more active, and to replicate them in other areas;
- Strengthen the monitoring mechanism for NPA implementation.

9.2.3 Law Enforcement

• Develop a social policy for children in contact with the law, which works towards the avoidance of double-victimization of these children, who are generally seen as offenders

rather than victims of circumstances, and which proposes alternative models of care and protection for children in contact with the law;

- Reform existing laws to remove inconsistencies and inherent weaknesses so that the exploiters, rather than the children, can be prosecuted more easily and efficiently;
- Methods to combat the prostitution of boys will not be effective if corruption prevents law enforcement. Strict measures should be taken to combat corruption and ensure effective law enforcement. Government should allocate more resources to ensure that the police force is adequately trained to deal with issues related to child sexual exploitation and abuse;
- Involve the local communities in detecting the prostitution of boys. This self-policing will not only check the incidences of prostitution of boys but also help to sensitize the community to the issue.

10.1 NGOS WORKING TO PROTECT CHILDREN FROM SEXUAL ABUSE AND EXPLOITATION

Islamabad capital Territory

1-Rozan (Aangan Project):

House 4-A. Street 34. F-8/1 Islamabad, Pakistan Email: aangan@apollo.net.pk

Rozan, Islamabad based, works on the issue of child sexual abuse, gender related issues and emotional health and well being of children and women. The Aangan project of Rozan has 5 components: children and violence; gender sensitization for communities and institutions, a youth help line and school packages designed to sensitize teachers on child sexual abuse and other child development issues. The Aanagn also provide psychosocial support in the form of therapy and counseling.

2-Sahil

No.13, First Floor, Al-Babar Centre F-8, Markaz, Islamabad Email: info@sahil.org

Sahil, Islamabad based, works on the prevention of child sexual abuse and its treatment in the family setting. Sahil keeps an updated statistics of the child sexual exploitation and abuse cases reported in the local and national newspapers. Sahil also provide counseling services and awareness programme for teachers, parents and children. It also provides services to victims and their families through a help line.

3-SACH (Struggle for Change)

House 3, Street 32, I-8/4 Islamabad

Email; khalida@apollo.net.pkSACH, Islamabad based, conducts community-based programmes with children in especially difficult circumstances, like refugees and runaway children. It provides shelter to women and children who have endured, physical and sexual violence. SACH also conducts awareness programme about child sexual abuse and domestic violence and provide psychosocial support services to victims of abuse and violence.

4-Save the Children UK

House 8, Street 30, F-8/1 Islamabad Email: gaisanwar@hotmail.com

Save the Children UK is collaborating with a number of NGOs in Pakistan and is funding projects on child protection and promotion of children's rights.

Lahore;

1-CRAC-PPA:

House 9, Street 38, Canal Park, Gulberg 3, Lahore Email: <u>drnzafar@hotmail.com</u>

2-Vision:

Email: vision@nexlinx.net.pk

Vision, Lahore based, is working on issues related to 'Men who have sex with Men"(MSM). It has a drop in centre and a programme of psychosocial support and health services for men with alternate sexual identities and orientation. Vision is also working on HIV/AIDS and issues related to commercial sexual exploitation in Lahore.

3-Savera

427-Gulshan Block, Allama Iqbal Town

Lahore

Email: <u>uzmatofiq@yahoo.com</u>

Savera, Lahore based, is working on issues related to child sexual abuse and sexually transmitted infections, including HIV/AIDS. Its programme mainly focuses on awareness raising of the target communities.

<u>Karachi</u>

1-CRAC-PPA

C/o Dr. Aisha Mahnaz Department of Paediatrics Civil Hospital Karachi

2-Lawyers for Human rights and legal Aid (LHRLA)

D-1, first Floor, Court View Apartments. Court Road, Karachi 74200 Email: lhrla@fascom.com

LINII. IIIIa@iascolli.com

LHRLA, Karachi based, is a legal intervention NGO working to secure justice and support for victims/survivors of violence, sexual abuse and trafficking. LHRLA also provide counseling services for the benefit of its legal exploiters. The organization is also running a help line, and refer psychological cases to professionals. LHRLA regularly publishes updated statistics on trafficking cases in Pakistan and use it as a tool for advocacy and lobbying.

3-Azad Foundation

E 135/2-D, Block 7,Gulshan-e-Iqbal Karachi 75300 Email: <u>azadfoundation@hotmail.com</u> Azad Foundation, Karachi based, conducts direct interventions with street children and youth. Through long-term relationships, they raise awareness on street children's rights, as well as arranging recreational activities for them. Sexual abuse cases are referred to the Foundation's resident psychologist. The foundation also works with families with the aim of providing traditional support for street children, and has started a project to record data on street children in Karachi.

Peshawar

1-CRAC-PPA

House 16, Street 13, K-3, Phase 3 Hyatabad, Peshawar, 25100 Email: <u>tufailm@brain.net.pk</u>

The Child Rights and Abuse Committee of Pakistan Pediatric Association has a mandate to promote and protect children's rights and work towards prevention of all forms of child abuse and neglect. The main strategies used by CRAC-PPA are research, advocacy and lobbying, awareness raising and capacity building. Being ECPAT affiliate, PPA has a special interest in child sexual abuse and exploitation and was instrumental in the formation of Working Group against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation. It also facilitated the Government in drafting the National Policy and Plan of Action against child sexual exploitation and carrying out the post Yokohama mid term review. PPA works through its 4 provincial and one federal chapter.

2-Save the Children Sweden

House 60-C, University Road University Town, Peshawar Email: radda@brain.net.pk

Save the Children Sweden, Pakistan office is collaborating with a number of NGOs and Government agencies in implementing projects on child protection particularly focusing on child sexual abuse and exploitation, juvenile justice system, violence against children and other child abuse related issues. It is also providing support to Working Group against child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation.

<u>Quetta</u>

CRAC-PPA C-31, GOR Colony Quetta Email; <u>amir-jogezai@hotmail.com</u>

10.2 BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books:

Fouzia Saeed. Taboo! The hidden culture of a red light area published by Oxford University press, Pakistan- 2003.

Child Rights and Abuse Committee, Pakistan Pediatric Association," Child Abuse for Casualty medical officers'- 1998

Briefing Papers:

Population Council Pakistan office, Population and Poverty- a Briefing paper - July 2004. Population Council Pakistan office, Population and Education- a Briefing paper- July 2004.

Conference proceedings:

University of Victoria Canada, Good practices in working with sexually exploited youth in America, 2001

International/Regional Declarations

Stockholm Declaration and agenda for Action against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, August1996

Yokohama Commitment against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children December 2001 South Asian Strategy against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and child sexual abuse November 2001

Reports

NCCWD and Unicef; In depth National Assessment in Pakistan of National developments post Yokohama in fighting commercial sexual exploitation of children and child sexual abuse in Pakistan -Dec.2003.

NCCR-Unicef-Child Abuse and Crimes against children in NWFP Pakistan-1997. NCCR-Unicef.Community perceptions of male child sexual abuse in NWFP, Pakistan 1997, UN Economic Commission for Asia and Pacific and NCCWD, Sexually abused and sexually exploited children and youth in Pakistan-2001

Trafficking of Women and children in Pakistan, the flesh trade report, 1995-6 Pakistan's response to UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, Second Periodic Report 2003 (NCCWD files)

PPA-SC Sweden, Exposure of children to pornography at the Internet cafés of Pakistan-Sept.2001

LHRLA-Trafficking of Women and Children in Pakistan, the flesh trade report 1995-96 ESCAP-NCCWD Government of Pakistan. Sexually Exploited and Abused youth children; a qualitative assessment of their health needs and services available to them in Pakistan

PPA-SC Sweden, Confronting reality, a situation analysis of child sexual abuse and exploitation in Pakistan -March 2000.

SAP Pakistan-Commercial sexual exploitation of Children, A review of South Asia-Pakistan perspective-Dec.2001

Ministry of Labor, Federal Bureau of Statistics and ILO. Pakistan Child Labor Survey-1996. State Bank of Pakistan, 2ndQuarterly Report - March 30,2004

Ministry of Finance Govt of Pakistan: Economic Survey of Pakistan, June 2004

Ministry of Social Welfare and Women Development. National Policy and Plan of Action against child Sexual abuse and Exploitation

Magazine:

Sunday Magazine Mashriq Peshawar Pakistan- Sept.2003.

Newspapers:

Daily Mashriq Peshawar Pakistan, Sex scandal in a City school, - Sept.8 and 9,2003 Aftab AK- Unemployment in Pakistan-A serious economic challenge, Daily News -Aug 8,2004.

Personal communication;

Sahil,SACH ,Rozan and SC UK Islamabad, Vision and Savera Lahore, Azad Foundation Karachi,

Save the Children Swedn, Peshawar Feb-March 2004

PPA Focal persons at Peshawar, Lahore, Quetta, Islamabad and Karachi March-Aug, 2004.

Unpublished Reports;

PPA-Unicef.Protection assessment among refugees and host communities in major urban areas of Pakistan (NWFP Report), 2002.

National Institute of Health, Ministry of Health Pakistan-Female commercial sex workers in Lahore, Karachi and Multan- a behavioral mapping study, Aug.2002.

South Asia Partnership International, p. 43-46, ESCAP, p.4.

Web page: ECPAT International website www.ecpat.net accessed on March 21 2004

UN Treaty website

i

ⁱⁱ A.K.M. Masud Ali and others. *Misplaced Childhood: a Short Study on the Street Child Prostitutes in Dhaka City.* INCIDIN (sponsored by Red Barnet: Danish Save the Children), 1997.

ⁱⁱⁱ Vinay Chandran & Chandra Shekhar Balachandran, (*Self-)Imposed Marginalities: Geographiles of Commercially and Sexually Exploited Male Children in Bangalore, India.* Paper presented at the 3rd IASSCS Conference: Melbourne, 1-3 October 2001.

^{iv} Jayashree Ramakrishna, Vinai Chandran, Mani Karott and Radhka Srinivasa Murthy. *Language and Behaviour as Media for Enactment of Desire among Sexually Exploited Male Children and Street Children in Bangalore, India.*

 ^v Sahil n.d. *Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation in Pakistan: An Overview*. Islamabad: Sahil, [1998?].
 ^{vi} NGO Coalition on Child Rights – NWFP/UNICEF. *Child Abuse and Crimes against Children in North*

West Frontier Province (Pakistan). Peshawar: NGO Coalition on Child Rights, [1998?].

^{vii} Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961, section 7.

viii	Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961, section 8.
Х	Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961, section 8.
ĸ	Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961, section 10(1).
ĸi	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 2(a).
xii	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, sections 4, 5(1).
xiii	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 5(2).
xiv	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, sections 10(1), (2).
κv	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 6(1), (2).
cvi	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 6(3).
cvii	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 7.
cviii	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, sections 10(1), (3).
xix	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 8.
κx	The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979, section 9.
xxi	Pakistan Penal Code 1860, section 292(a).
xxii	Pakistan Penal Code 1860, section 292(b).
xiii	Pakistan Penal Code 1860, section 292(c).
xxiv	Pakistan Penal Code 1860, section 292(d).
xxv	Pakistan Penal Code 1860, section 292.
^{xxvi} and Ch	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution ild Pornography, Art. 2(c).
xxvii	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 2(h).
xxviii	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 3(i).
xxix	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 1(f).
xxx	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 3(i).
xxxi	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 3(iii).
xxxii	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 3(iii).
xxxiii	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 3(iv).
xxiv	The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 3(iv).

- ^{xxxv} The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 4.
- ^{xxxvi} The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 5.
- ^{xxxvii} The Prevention and Control of Human Trafficking Ordinance, 2002, Article 6(iii).
- xxxviii Pakistan Suppression of Prostitution Ordinance, 1961, section 9.
- ^{xxxix} The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance, 1979, section 11.
- ^{xl} The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance, 1979, section 12.
- ^{xli} The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance, 1979, sections 13, 14.
- ^{xlii} The Offence of Zina (Enforcement of *Hudood*) Ordinance, 1979, section 16.
- xliii See http://www.fia.gov.pk/default.htm, http://www.fia.gov.pk/abt_mission.htm.
- ^{xliv} See <u>http://www.fia.gov.pk/dep_awar_traff.htm</u>.
- ^{xlv} See <u>http://www.fia.gov.pk/camel.htm</u>.

⁵ South Asia Partnership International. *A Review of South Asia-Pakistan Perspective 2001*. SAP Pakistan. December 2001, p.58.

⁶ Website of Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid. Accessed on July 26, 2005 at http://www.lhrla.sdnpk.org/madadgar.html

⁷ "In depth assessment of the national developments post Yokohama in Pakistan, through implementation of the National Plan of Action Against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation and other initiatives". NCCWD- UNICEF, December 2004.

⁸ Sahil, "Against Child Sexual Abuse: Annual report 2003". Accessed on June 23, 2005 from: http://www.sahil.org/

⁹ UN Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific. *Sexually Abused and Sexually Exploited Children and Youth in Pakistan*, New York, 2001. Accessed on June 17, 2005 from: http://www.unescap.org/esid/hds/sexual/pakistan.pdf